OUTSIDE THE FRAME: AN INVESTIGATION INTO VISUAL NARRATIVE STRUCTURES OF THREE URBAN ENVIRONMENTS

Anna Fairchild

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO THE UNIVERSITY OF BEDFORDSHIRE, IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTERS OF ARTS BY RESEARCH

DECEMBER 2011
OUTSIDE THE FRAME: AN INVESTIGATION INTO VISUAL NARRATIVE STRUCTURES OF THREE URBAN ENVIRONMENTS

ANNA FAIRCHILD

ABSTRACT

Narrative structures were explored and examined between the culturally contrasting urban environments of London, Luton and Istanbul.

Through the visual creative processes of drawing, printmaking and photography images were used to explore how these processes could be combined with a view to revealing alternative narrative structures within two-dimensional images.

A large body of two-dimensional work of varying scales was made between 2009 and 2011. Throughout the project a visual and written journal was kept using reflection of the deconstruction of the combinations of images to clarify the insights gained. The results of the analysis and evaluation in this journal combined with contextualization of the emerging work formed the basis for working methods, which revealed new narratives or stories between and within the developing series of two-dimensional images.

It was these results of this analysis and evaluation combined with qualitative responses to from artists, filmmakers, writers and others which enabled these working methods to establish the base for practice-led research into visual narrative structures.

Through this practice-led research it was established that using the working methods above, alternative narrative structures could articulate a complex range of both personal memories together with that of wider range of experiences across culturally contrasting urban environments selected at the beginning of the 21st Century.
DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis is my own unaided work. It is being submitted for the Master of Arts by Research Degree at the University of Bedfordshire.

It has not been submitted before for any degree or examination in any other University.

Name of Candidate: Anna Fairchild             Signature:
Date: 7.12.11
# List of Contents

Abstract

List of Contents.....................................................................................................................4

List of Plates..........................................................................................................................5

Acknowledgements..................................................................................................................7

Introduction............................................................................................................................8

Chapter 1: A Beginning..........................................................................................................9

Chapter 2: Working Methods...............................................................................................22

Chapter 3: Analysis and Evaluation.....................................................................................47

Chapter 4: Conclusion..........................................................................................................104

List of References..................................................................................................................108

Bibliography..........................................................................................................................110
List of Plates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fig.</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01</td>
<td>Film poster by Anna Fairchild for Turkish film 'Ara' by Umit Unal, 2008</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02</td>
<td><em>Grapefruit</em> by Yoko Ono 1964</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03a</td>
<td>Map of working method</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03b</td>
<td>Diagram of practice led research process</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03c</td>
<td>Screen print collage</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>04a</td>
<td><em>Land of the Lost</em> poster, 2009</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>04b</td>
<td><em>Gidis Donus</em> poster, 2009</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>04c</td>
<td><em>Almost half Way There</em>, 2008</td>
<td>420</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>05a</td>
<td><em>The Perfect Day</em>, 2008</td>
<td>420</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>05b</td>
<td><em>Here to There</em>, A Fairchild, 2010</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06</td>
<td>Cave painting from Lascaux, France</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07</td>
<td><em>Tree at Tretaire</em>, Frank Aurbach, 1975</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>08</td>
<td><em>Wish Tree Hill</em>, Anna Fairchild, 2010</td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09</td>
<td><em>Lost Things</em>, Anna Fairchild, 2010</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td><em>Here to There</em>, A Fairchild, 2010</td>
<td>302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td><em>Untitled</em>, Joan Mitchell, 1959/60</td>
<td>363</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td><em>No, No, No</em>, Emilio Vedova, 1969</td>
<td>363</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td><em>Istanbul</em>, Devrim Erbil</td>
<td>374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td><em>Istanbul</em>, Devrim Erbil</td>
<td>374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td><em>Dust and Dispute</em>, Bashir Makhoul, 2008</td>
<td>386</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td><em>17 by Serge Clement.</em></td>
<td>459</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td><em>Wish Tree Hill</em>, Anna Fairchild, 2010</td>
<td>460</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td><em>Woman Behind a Mashrabiya</em>, Susan Hefuna</td>
<td>460</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>by John Latham</td>
<td>480</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td><em>How did we get here</em>? at Locus, Anna Fairchild, 2009</td>
<td>494</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td><em>Ara Film Clip still 2008</em></td>
<td>504</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td><em>Wish Tree Hill</em>, Anna Fairchild, 2010</td>
<td>564</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Andrei Tarkovsky, polaroids 1979-84</td>
<td>571</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Wishing Tree, Goreme, Central Anatolia, Turkey</td>
<td>605</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Pots Tree, Anatolia, Turkey</td>
<td>605</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Buckets Tree, Dorset, England</td>
<td>605</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td><em>Lost Things</em>, Anna Fairchild</td>
<td>645</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td><em>The Ambassadors</em>, Hans Holbein, 1533</td>
<td>645</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Circus font</td>
<td>659</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td><em>Here to There</em>, Anna Fairchild</td>
<td>650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Shadow Tracing</td>
<td>660</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Stones left on tree fossil, Dorset, UK</td>
<td>660</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank John Stephens at the University of Bedfordshire for his invaluable support with the writing of this thesis.
OUTSIDE THE FRAME: AN INVESTIGATION INTO ALTERNATIVE VISUAL NARRATIVE STRUCTURES BETWEEN CONTRASTING URBAN ENVIRONMENTS

“So short was time
That between morning and evening
There was no noon
And already on the old familiar ground
Stood mountains of concrete.”1

Within this research project I will explore narrative and time sequencing within two-dimensional images in relation to contemporary urban environments. Based on my existing practice of drawing, print and photography the research will analyze and review how these creative media can be developed manipulated and used to examine both visual and conceptual characteristics of three selected urban centres. These areas of practice will be used to gather new insights into visual narrative within these contrasting urban environments. Analysis, reflection and contextualization of this will then form the basis of a practice led research project. This research will aim to establish ‘to what extent can visually recorded memories from one urban space together with images from another be fused through print, drawing and photography to create a new way of creating narrative which explores ideas and concepts within present time and place and its relationship to past or future events within the context of culturally contrasting urban environments?’

1 Brecht, B 1920 from the poem ‘On The Crushing Impact of the Cities’, p.108
A Beginning

Throughout the process of designing and making the poster for the Turkish film ‘Ara’2 (Space Between) 2007 (Fig. 1) in collaboration with the director Umit Unal, much of the work I was visually and conceptually undertaking was a ‘bringing together’ of the disciplines my work had encompassed up to that point. It was also based in a personal experience of “bridging the gap” between contrasting urban cultures whilst living in Istanbul from 1990 into the new millennium. Within my practice the disciplines had included drawing, installation and recorded temporary spatial events and photography. Enquiry into some areas of narrative structure, which were based on ideas of sequential ordering of narrative fragments through series of works or filmic extracts, had also been explored. The ‘Ara’ poster was developed to advertise an existing film exploring the relationship between four individuals living within a large 21st Century urban environment. I was aware that this resonated with themes within both my own practice as well as other artists’ work in the fields of drawing, print and photography from the 20th and 21st Centuries I was engaged with visually. This led to a question of how the various ways individuals or communities experience the urban spaces we inhabit could influence a visual narrative. Could the fusion of three areas of my practice investigate an apparent urban dilemma that ‘at street level all modern cities are violent and tragic’3 whilst acting as a platform for exploring the possibility that if a personal or community experience of displacement existed, could that be combined with a more historical visual record or personal

memory or experience? How could this be developed through narrative reference in various forms using the concept of poster images or some form of advertising and the existence of past events, or those yet to exist?

This idea of work as a traditional poster format referring to combinations of events ‘Outside the Frame’ of traditional linear narrative provided an opportunity for research into areas within my practice which could create new ways of expressing the combination of complex human experiences, personal memories and other more shared visual imagery within selected contrasting 21st century urban environments. The title and aim of the project was to explore how the observations and memory of ten years of personal experience of moving between contrasting cultures and environments could be fused with a wider contemporary urban experience and other interesting and revealing visual elements from the chosen cities of London, Luton and Istanbul. The aim of this was to explore how this mix of visual references and narratives from outside the frame of an accepted sequential or linear format could still be combined within a standard rectangular visual framework to alternatively describe complex narratives, which could bridge the gap between the contrasting urban spaces chosen.

The idea of the artwork existing as a reference to events outside the framework of the art image/object being made had precedence particularly within the conceptual art originating during European and American art of the 1970s. Much of the conceptual artist Yoko Ono’s work from this period is based on instructions, which revolve around thought and imagination so that the work of art exists in the mind alone.4 An example of Ono’s work, which contextually set precedence for this kind of concern in my own practice, is a piece entitled *Grapefruit*. (Fig.2)

---

This piece, originally published in 1964, consists of a book as an object which contains a series of 'event scores' or rather descriptions of what might take place as the event that replace the physical work with instructions that an individual may, or may not, wish to enact. This replacement of the 'work of art' as an object by an allusion to something we cannot actually see or touch, but have to comprehend instead, was taken, explored and developed.
during the 1970s, but had its origins in the Dada art of the early 20th Century, when the first important questions of what constitutes a work of art were raised. In many ways referring to the apparent contradiction within events in contemporary urban environments ‘Outside the Frame’ looked at taking these events and memories and piecing them back together within the framework of a series of rectangular images. This was done to explore how complex notions of time and space could articulate ideas when confined to a simple restriction of place (a two dimensional image).

This kind of work existed in my own practice, where I had explored the format of poster and flyer imagery, referencing actual external events or memories of them. I was interested in how this could be the catalyst for a new body of work utilizing my personal experience of bridging the gap between contrasting urban cultures like the ones I had become immersed in since 1990 whilst living in Istanbul and returning to the UK. On return to each it was the contrasts and contradictions particularly within that urban space coupled with those of Luton and London which would begin to form the basis of my investigation. Many of these experiences had informed my work as an artist, but could also refer to an experience of other inhabitants of multi-cultural urban environments at the beginning of the 21st Century. This experience could resonate with a wider audience and reflect a more common one relevant to the contemporary global community.

Much of the contemporary contextual work I was engaged in looking at were precedents for this kind of approach. Artists who in any case were often themselves immersed in the urban experience were attempting to describe and reflect upon concerns, which were both personal and universal at the same time. As the Lutz Becker, the curator of Modern Times: Responding to Chaos observed in 2010,

“The art of the twentieth century and of our time is distinctly urban, largely uninvolved in the contemplation of nature. The city, the place where mankind re-invents itself, is the milieu in which most contemporary artists study, work and find their inspiration. The asymmetries of urban life provide the contrasts, contradictions and conflicts, the sparking points for most artistic discoveries and advances.”

These contrasts, contradictions and conflicts lead to a dilemma, which is not only relevant to lives within urban centres, but the global urban network also – the city of the worldwide web. In a recent essay by Iain Boyd Whyte, ‘Modernity, Architecture and the City’, 2010, which discusses this very state he quotes Karl Marx remarking on an epoch, before the 1917 Russian Revolution, with similar contradictions;

---

“On the one hand there have started into life industrial and scientific forces which no epoch of human history has ever suspected. On the other hand, there exist symptoms of decay, surpassing the horrors of the latter times of the Roman Empire. In our days everything is pregnant with its contrary.”

These contrasting ideas and concepts were to provide the cornerstone of the research project. Perhaps something of an exorcism of a personal experience could take place through the process of constructing a series of new images, whilst also reflecting more universal concerns. That is the contradiction of both the physical and visual decay of urban centres contrasting with their potential power as a catalyst for re-growth, fusion and change.

Drawing was an obvious experimental part of my practice as it had always been the starting point not only for me, but many other artists. As Lutz Becker describes in his introduction to his recent review of 20th century drawing it is “for the contemporary artist the most accessible terrain for experimentation- an expression of freedom.” However, the work of many contemporary artists who have explored the use of combined techniques as well as my own previous work suggested that other possibilities for more of a universal reading to a set of new works could be offered. Time could possibly be alluded to more directly if the images were layered with a variety of media or change in source of imagery. The cities themselves seemed again to reflect this variety and suggested using a combination of media. In terms of creative practice it also appeared to be a more flexible method, allowing for the possibility of new avenues or tangents to be explored and uncharted narratives to be constructed or revealed. For example tangential narratives could emerge through the actual elements combined, or through serendipitous combinations of overlay of both image and text. Other projects, which occur within the same area or time frame, could become linked visually or by concept. One of these was to be my ‘Glasshouse Stories’ project at Luton Hoo Walled Garden in early 2011.

This development of tangential narratives as the practice leading the way forward directed by process and combinations of visual images, naturally making way for analysis and reflection of how the work could branch off to then allow insights into my practice as well as revealing alternative visual narrative structures, some questions to be answered, yet opening the way for others to be asked. It then became a method for research and the means of research

---

6 Marx, K Speech at the Anniversary of the People’s Paper (1856), Lutz Becker, Modern Times: responding to chaos, 2010, England
itself, creating a model of investigation, embedded in the process of practice. (Fig 3a & 3b) A wide-ranging variety of images were made using varied creative media. Tangential narratives emerged often spontaneously or through the direct result of the naturally occurring palimpsest of visual images. Analysis and evaluation of how these occurred and what insights into narrative structure could be gained from them were critical and one particular example of this reflection of practice were the large fragmented prints where elements of image were repeated, inverted and erased (Fig 3c).

"The identification of significant elements (distant tree for example) become almost like a note to the main narrative, hidden beneath much of the rest of the image, which has been sprayed over. What was an already dense area of the image in the bottom right hand corner now more refers to an urban density simply because it has been isolated and identified as significant – space is constrained around it because of the contrast in tone between dense drawing and white space. And hovering above and over all of this is the very enlarged image of an object found during the making of the drawing itself, which could be seen to describe the end of another place or natural habitat and the moving of urban boundaries yet again."

Photography was another tool of practice. Looking at the work of Bashir Makhoul the Palestinian artist, who explores the displacement of a people through the overlay of historical and contemporary photographic images. In his work we are unable to ignore either past or present views of the same urban setting, forcing us to review impact of damage and displacement, both physical and emotional. This combination of the past and the present allows us to gain an insight into the link between those two time frames. Like Makhoul, Turkish artist Zeynep Bingol Cifti reflects the shared experiences of a developing, yet different multi-cultural urban centre. Ciftci’s work also uses combined photos. Within my research could this be more fully explored where a recalled drawn memory or narrative was also included, combined with photography and through the use of a poster style format, with references to media and other events, could the speed of urban change be reflected? Could this combination create new narrative structures using elements of drawn, traced or recalled images?

---

8 Fairchild, A, Outside the Frame journal, 2011
How could this be described by one of the posterers — or how could this be a model for the nature of the making of the thing or the process of practice becomes research.

Fig.3a Map of working method
Fig. 3b Diagram of practice led-research process
Fig. 3c Screen print collage
Other artists have worked extensively with the overlay of drawn, traced or architectural plans like Ingrid Calame or Jenny Wiener. These artists have often explored historical spaces through contemporary media and ways of working which suggest visual reverberations reflecting modern urban growth. Whole new worlds or maps from ‘other territories’ could be unearthed. In other words, maps of emotional or physical responses to a space rather than maps of a space can be created. Then there were contextual examples of sequencing through both still frame and the moving photographic image in the filmmaker Frank Winzenstén’s animated sequences with surprising overlays of the personal and historical, creating new ‘maps’ or, similarly, David Claerbout’s exploration of the relationship between events through time using parallel film sequences.

The concept of the poster alluding to events outside the frame, would explore further ideas in previous work, ‘Posters for unmade films’, ‘Land of the Lost’ and ‘There and back’ 2009. (Figs. 4a, b) Posters or found printed fragments have been utilised in the making of art since their introduction by the Cubists and Dadaists in the early 20th Century and I was interested in exploring this concept further with reference to more contemporary artists such as Raymond Hains, who worked with actual film poster fragments in the 1970s and, more recently, Emily Jacir’s ‘Materials for a film’, 2004, where fragments of real ephemera such as documents and book pages offer their own compelling narrative for other external events outside the frame. The modern urban experience could be explored through work such as this. Other previous works, such as those exhibited in the show ‘Locus’ at the Bath Festival in 2008 titled ‘How did we get here?’ (Fig. 5a,b) explored other aspects of this fragmentation. Here, combinations of print process including digital were combined onto existing antique book pages creating multiple narrative constructions, which accessed visually, recalled memory in a radial sense whilst exploring ideas of variant time sequencing through non-linear narrative structures. In other words, the passing of time and history reflected in the contemporary urban environment could be expressed and visualised in a similar way through fragmentation and combination.

Using these ideas as a premise, the initial intention for the project was to start with the construction of three drawn poster images whose sequence could be altered, perhaps re-interpreted to offer alternative suggestions of time frames and events between locations. Throughout the project this narrative sequence could then become dismantled. The project

---

could become more about how far it could articulate through description and reflection the complexities of experiences within contrasting urban centres. Indeed, would there need to be more reference to other historical forms of visual narrative for this to be realised from perhaps earliest drawings by man on rock walls to a more layered structure — simpler, yet with more concentrated substance? Would there need to be more references across time and space to echo Charles Baudelaire, ‘It is always seems to me that I should feel well in the place where I am not’, reflecting the experience of the contemporary urban dilemma and the yearning for a space and time other than the here and now. Here, many, or indeed most city inhabitants are aliens within the space in which they live. This alienation reflects a more universal condition of the modern person, which I had previously explored through various combinations of print process including digital, mono print and collograph. The use of screen-printing as new aspect to my practice seemed to offer extended possibilities and new qualities within multiples of an image could be produced, then deconstructed, directing or determining the actual nature of images produced as well as revealing new tangential narratives to explore.

Fig.4a Land of the Lost poster, 2009

Fig. 4b Gidis Donus poster, 2009
Examination of these narratives or tangents could then be used to more fully understand the urban environments more fully and question to what extent these spaces could be visually reflected within the framework of both a personal and community historical perspective. Focus on the speed of change of visual images within complex urban cultures, could also be explored and communicated as Susan Sontag says when describing a lack of activism where poster style imagery could more poignantly articulate and images be formed, which could reflect some main aspects of the contemporary human urban experience.

Images which could explore to what extent meaning or understanding of this complex seemingly perpetual state of visual change which seems to imprison social change can be created through individual and sequences of images and become an expression of the apparent perpetual state of visual change which could possibly thwart actual social change. Could these images actually become a small catalyst for some form of change within the perception of the viewer and become a method of understanding our modern physical, cultural and emotional urban landscape? ‘In other words, to understand ourselves we need to look searchingly at our landscapes for they are a clue to culture’

---

10 Lewis, P (1979), ‘Axioms for reading the Landscape’, 11-32 in Meinig ibid

in Taylor, K Landscape and Memory, 2008, p. 2
Indeed, how and what can we learn from the urban environment which surrounds us and to what extent can this be a directive or guide for the interaction between people or between aspects of visual imagery? To what extent, as John Berger observes poignantly in his writing, ‘Ralph Fasanella and The City’, can aspects of the urban act as a paradigm for creation of an alternative ‘series of images, a circuit of messages...’ and a method of learning and developing through practice based research where ‘A city teaches and conditions by its appearances, its facades and its plan’\textsuperscript{11}.

The research explores how time passing can have a variety of impacts on the concept we have of the space we exist in and our understanding of past of future time frames. Exploration of ideas of journeys of memory between known spaces or environments together with visual references of those actual spaces could reveal new possibilities.

To this extent it was anticipated that a visual exploration of aspects of personal memory of chosen urban references be included. This would form part of the visual development within the images, and would contrast with shared domains or experiences.

It was anticipated that images be combined and explored in a similar way to those made for ‘Land of the Lost’ and ‘There and Back’ in 2009 (Fig.4a, b). In these works hand drawn, more personal images from experience were combined with photograph records or traces of existing contemporary urban spaces.

Having described the basis for this investigation this next section will consider the working methods used as practice led research which have given insights into how I use these methods and how in effect they can be used to gain specifically individual as well as combined insights into the development of non-linear visual urban narratives. It is not only the use of these areas of my practice but my personal experience of the cities I have explored and nuances of their combinations within a wider framework, which have allowed me to develop new and subtle explorations of visual narrative.

\textsuperscript{11} Berger, J, About Looking, Ralph Fasanella and the City, p.104, 1991, USA.
**Working Methods**

Through exploration of the practices below, the main objective was to establish a way of working where *combinations* of drawing, print and photography could effectively communicate the concept of *now* as a future memory. How could this model be used to reflect and explore ideas of the speed of accelerated change within urban environments and the community inertia that may arise out of that speed of change? Could this then form the basis for an antidote alternative to the concept that urban communities have been created where ‘social change is replaced by a change in images’?12

Could the inherent qualities of several aspects of practice be used to describe a range of experiences from the personal to the wider public one across cultures, places and time?

I used the aspects of drawing, print and photography already embedded within my practice to explore new combinations and models for answering questions of visual sequences and narrative structure within two-dimensional drawn, collaged and poster images. This section will look at the aim of exploring differing aspects of the three selected contrasting urban

environments through characteristics inherent within the processes stated above. How could they be used both individually and in a combined way to reveal new models based more on a loose-leaf form of narrative as opposed to a sequential or linear one?

My practice was used to explore and establish various combinations of ideas and images. This is the artistic process, which led, through reflection, analysis and contextualisation to gain insights to be then used as research to direct further investigation into visual urban narratives. Critical to the reflection and analysis was my reflective journal. This became a record of experimentation, investigation and analysis both in visual and written form. Visually this included collections of images of objects, small-scale working drawings, sketches as well as images of other artists work within context. It was more often than not the starting point for any new ideas, which were then explored further through larger images using the processes of my practice.

In written form it was a place for analysis of the developing images and where often recognition of how new narrative structures had occurred and how the many tangential narratives were to begin. Critical to the contextualisation was to discover how my images and ideas were similar to and how they differed from those of other artists working in similar practice or concerns. It is a particular method of exploration and as Graeme Sullivan states when discussing the work of the artist Jayne Dyer, 'to situate one’s practice within the broader fields of experience is to signal to others what is reflective yet distinctive about art practice.'

The critical analysis of experimental combinations of images meant that the processes of practice could be understood and utilised as a research method. Here my ongoing written and visual journal was pivotal to this structured analysis of all aspects of my practice. Through analysis in the journal and the new directions taken from this analysis a working method of using my practice to lead research was established.

The written and visual analysis within this journal of the images and combinations through layering, both controlled and serendipitous, of visually recorded aspects of the three cities was a method understanding and interpreting the deconstruction within the emerging images.

---

13 Images from my reflective journal can be located at www.annafairchildmres.co.uk

14 Sullivan, G, Art Practice as Research, 2005, p.135, UK
Deconstruction as we understand in the Derridian sense can be seen as the subverting of the standard pictorial structures within the emerging images by way of the clashes of imagery and omissions of areas of the combined images, which occurred through the way I used my creative process and combinations of the visual images I employed. The serendipity of the aspects of my creative process allowed new interplays and upsetting of the conventional pictorial structures within the images to give meanings which could provide a richer understanding because of their new comparison through layering and visual relationship or contrast to one another; Derrida’s idea of “difference”.

Through this further exploration built on the reflection and critical analysis of how and why the resulting images reflected personal and wider contemporary urban environments and through the qualitative feedback given by a range of other artists and writers the practice was able to be used to gain valuable and often striking new insights into alternative narrative structures. This would also reveal how there could be varying readings dependent upon the experiences of the viewer and the context of the time and place in which the work was viewed. From these insights many new directions for investigation were established.

Another key point here was the setting of the work I was producing within a context I had established for my practice of historical and contemporary art. Here, work made on similar themes or within a similar context of cities or combinations of creative processes. The comparisons within this established context of art was critical to an understanding of the newly emerging ideas at within my project which was a way newly emerging was a way of “...engaging within it and going all around it...” \(^{15}\)

In terms of how these aspects of practice can be used as a method of research, this section will explain how drawing can provide a more intuitive or personal recall response to a location, subject or theme, photography more of a ‘trace’ or ‘stencil’ exploration of physical aspects of the cities and printmaking more of a response, which allows chance or serendipitous interference inherent within the characteristics of the process itself.

As a fundamental aspect to my practice, drawing is the most immediate, intuitive response for me to record something seen, felt or remembered. Drawing, or rather the act of making (human) marks to represent something important or as a way of explaining, examining and analysing the unknown was the first kind of information man left to others. We can see this in

\(^{15}\) Derrida, J, The Truth in Painting, p.32
examples of early cave painting from sites such as Chauvet in the South of France. (Fig.6)
Continually, since these first endeavours ‘...All artistic movements, whether consciously or not, seek the destruction of traditional aesthetic worlds, the reduction of ‘forms’ to elementary germinal embryonic states, in the hope of creating ‘fresh worlds’, or in other words, of abolishing the history of art and re-living the dawning moment when man saw the world for the first time.’

It is probably the most accessible form of experimentation open to the artist. It is also through this direct application that artists can be intuitive, expressive, yet controlled, exploring, analysing and utilising this valuable area of creative practice. It is a way for artists to observe, question, examine or recall from memory the visual or emotional witnessing of things, places or events. This can either be separately explored or in combination with other methods potentially offering new questions to be answered together with new models to answer those concerns. Drawing can record simultaneous aspects of looking. These simultaneous aspects of looking are what John Berger describes when he refers to drawing as a method for exploring,

‘To draw is to look, examining the structure of appearances. A drawing of a tree shows, not a tree, but a tree-being-looked-at. Whereas the sight of a tree is registered almost instantaneously, the examination of the sight of a tree (a tree-being-looked-at) not only takes minutes or hours instead of a fraction of a second, it also involves, derives from, and refers back to, much previous experience of looking...This is how the act of drawing refuses the process of disappearances and proposes the simultaneity of a multitude of moments.’

Much akin to early man in his albeit unconscious quest to fix time on a cave wall, our concerns are inevitably to fix our own time and its structure to the crumbling walls of our urban cave. To articulate the complex stories of urban experiences we have lived and through image making/painting as Derrida describes when he says that ‘The first writing is thus a painted image’. This The capturing of multitudes of urban experience and moments was to be explored through this invaluable aspect; an aspect, which could comfortably combine visual references imbuing them with complex narratives.

Frank Auerbach’s, ‘Tree at Tretire’, 1975 (Fig.7) is a perfect example of this combination of references and the techniques Auerbach adopts to say he has looked at this tree and this tree will remain now it has been looked at. One could adopt such a style of looking to address other observational concerns. My intention is to utilise various ways of looking and drawing to explore aspects of the urban centres, which are the focus of my research.

Berger describes three ways in which drawings function; studies and questioning of the visible; recalls from memory; the placing down and communicating of ideas.19 Firstly, we may record what we see and understand from direct observation, leaving a record of what has been witnessed. These drawings are studies of the world or people around us and often used by the artist as research for further work, which may include combinations of the other two functions of drawing. Some aspects of each of my initial three drawings have elements of this type of direct observational drawing.

In the drawing ‘Wish Tree Hill’ (Fig.8) where each of the individual pieces of tied fabric are drawn from observation along with the branches in the foreground. The emphasis here is the fact that these objects have been visually registered and remembered at some point in the past. This is used to create a detailed focus here on these objects and their obvious importance to the concept of the piece of work.

The second image, ‘Lost Things’ (Fig.9) again includes directly observed drawn elements in the form of the array of lost objects scattered over the ground. These objects appear to have been placed within a combination of other types of drawing within the image.

The third image in the series, ‘Here to There’ (Fig.10) uses both elements of directly observed drawing, the branch and discarded child’s toy in the foreground, together with drawing from plants and grasses which, using the sunlight as a projection device, leaves an almost ‘photographic’ like impression of actual objects from the location in which the drawing was made. The intention here with this method of drawing, or tracing of images directly from their projected image was to place new input into my practice. With consideration and after some experimentation it seemed that it solved one of the dilemmas of foreground versus background I had previously been exploring. Where artists like Ingrid Calame have used repeated tracings of different spaces, the idea here was to extend the process of tracing to

---

place different methods of drawing within the image to reveal a broader range of possible answers to the research question.

Fig. 6 Cave painting from Lascaux, France

Fig. 7 Tree at Tretaire, Frank Auerbach, 1975
Fig. 8 Wish Tree Hill, Anna Fairchild, 2010
Fig. 8 Wish Tree Hill, Anna Fairchild, 2010
Fig. 9 Lost Things, Anna Fairchild, 2010
Searching for answers, it is in the act of image making drawing or painting that we, as artists, defy the passing of time, unlike looking where the image on the retina is recorded only then to disappear. Drawing can unravel images, memories or narrative, which appear to have been lost. For it is in the act of recall through the visual recording of a scene or witnessed event that new meaning about or connection between past, present and future time or events can be visually established or examined.

The use of drawing here, within my practice reflects Berger’s theory of the second function of drawing ‘...made to exorcise a memory which is haunting, in order to take an image once and for all out of the mind and put it on paper’20 and is entirely applicable as it is being utilised to extract information from the memory of looking.

Both the drawings, ‘Wish Tree Hill’ and ‘Here to There’ were made with the intention of utilising this function to extract a narrative of memory. Using this memory of the visual qualities of places visited in the past as a method of creating some form of autobiographical narrative relating to radically contrasting urban environments, comparing a location experienced in the present time with one from the past. The concept here was to examine how using drawing through recall of visual memory could create a starting point, a wall for the palimpsest of narrative to emerge from.

‘There are echoes of lost childhoods with the teddy. Echoes of the past, written in a smudged diary. Are our memories smudged? The Past? Do we remember our past through rose tinted glasses?’21

‘I see quite a tense sadness about the loss of valuable personal objects that symbolizes ones childhood, relationships or past ideas and works.’22

From here it was intended to add or subtract elements offering the opportunity for a new methods of exploration within the narrative structure of one image or a sequence of images. Richard Serra is quoted as saying that he could imagine nothing, in any of the arts, that was

---

20 Berger, J Berger on Drawing, 2008, Ireland, p.49
21 Ross, C, Outside the Frame Responses, 2011
22 Unal, U, Outside the Frame Responses, 2011
so autobiographically direct as drawing,’23 offering the opportunity for longevity of a visual memory and as the story triumphs over oblivion; music offers a centre; the drawing challenges disappearance.’24

The third function of drawing Berger describes, which is the placing down and communicating of ideas is utilised by all three drawings and indeed later on during the deconstruction of the screen-printed images through drawing. This is where the combination of all aspects of drawing proved invaluable as a means of analyzing and refinement of, not only the composition, but also the concept within the drawings and other poster works. For the drawn images to have worked in any respect within the framework of a new method of exploration they had to become self-generating and directing and indeed it will be discussed below how the actual research through collage and inclusion of other found and unexpected, incidental imagery came to direct the very nature of the project.

The process of screen-printing, new to my practice offered a way for the images to be translated into multiples, whilst retaining the integrity and prominent qualities within the initial three drawn images. It would also prove interesting later on to consider how the character of the printing process allowed serendipitous qualities to emerge. This meant that new directions or dimensions could be added to the existing idea or model of drawing overlaid with photography. This I had previously explored with the series ‘Posters for unseen events’. In other words, where these posters had been drawn and then overlaid with photography, these new works would differ. The drawings would become a starting point for exploration. Through this difference of approach the drawing was far more thoroughly taken apart and examined, becoming ‘lived’ prior to the addition of any photographic images being introduced. This approach to re-making drawings through print and collage allowed a wider gap to emerge between this and the photographic images being used. When placed together this meant that the contrast between the processes could be highlighted. These contrasts were then used to suit the working methods of utilising new narratives emerging through the combined processes.

Photography’s greatest attribute, perhaps, is that it enables us to fix the ‘now’ in order to preserve it for the future. It is of course not true that the camera never lies. For the moment the shutter is released is at the discretion and selection of who holds the ‘mechanical eye’ and the focus of the lens. However, what the camera does ‘and what the eye can never do, is to fix the appearance of that event.’

It was anticipated that images of the contrasting urban environments would be used to ‘fix’ elements of this urban ‘now’ within the context of other more personal or intuitive images made through other processes such as drawing and print. To what extent could these photographs be representations of the urban landscape as a whole or fragments of this landscape? Photography would be the ‘trace’ content of the series of images where there is the intention that as Susan Sontag states ‘A photograph is not only an image...it is also a trace, something stencilled off the real...’

A photograph in any given time and space is an unrepeatable event something which can never be recalled in that same format ‘...like a footprint or a death mask.’ It records the singular momentary visual appearance of a place, person or object.

Because the photographs would retain a completely different quality to the drawn images it was also anticipated, based on the previous work with film posters for unseen events, that the combination of these two methods would offer numerous readings and reveal new layers within the combined processes which could offer up new narrative structures relating to contrasting time frames.

As a method of expressing the contemporary urban dilemma, the photographs would reveal the presence of a witness to the urban space and as Berger says ‘Only somebody who has lived in the streets of a city, suffering some kind of misery, can be aware of what the paving stones, the doorways, the bricks, the windows signify. At street level – outside a vehicle – all modern cities are violent and tragic.’ This inherent difference of photography was one critical aspect to my working methods whereby the contrasts between a photographic ‘trace’ of an actual place or event was later combined with a more personal record of memory or experience of times and places through the processes of drawing and collage.

---

27 Berger, J About Looking, Ralph Fasanella and the City, p. 105, 1991, USA
Screen-printing was chosen as a new part of my practice. In terms of its inherent qualities, this method would offer almost a duplicate of the drawn image yet possessing some serendipitous or less personal qualities outside the frame of the original drawing. This could then be tampered with or altered in relation to concepts of describing varying time frames. Incidental attributes would further direct the research and open up more possibilities within the newly discovered models. These new insights, hitherto unknown at the onset of the research project were to prove fundamental in determining the nature and direction of the collaged images eventually produced. For example, within the process of printing such large scale pieces, where all detail was initially of paramount importance, there appeared ‘faults’ or discrepancies in the multiple images produced; some areas appeared fainter or did not emerge at all dependant on the pressure exerted on the screen, which at such a scale was almost inevitable. Whilst in the beginning many attempts were made to eradicate these ‘faults’ the ‘unsuccessful prints were to prove quite directional in suggesting how areas could be left unprinted or even blocked out so that some other meaning was revealed or so that space could be left to be filled with images from other processes such as tracing, drawing or collage. Indeed as Alberto Giacometti once said, albeit in regard drawing, he wasn’t sure which of the pencil and rubber was the more important.  

Artists have often used a variety of techniques and ranges of processes in their work. These were artists who had removed, printed over or reworked images using a variety of techniques across a range of processes.

The painter Joan Mitchell from the 1960s (Fig.11) who used lighter tones such as white over darker greys and blacks to create the impression of marks appearing beneath the surface of the printed image.

Painter and printmaker Emilio Vedova’s reworked lithographic prints such as ‘No, No, No’ from 1969, (Fig.12) which display complex layers of marks and text many of them painterly in their appearance, fragments of an urban space. Using this kind of image as precedence, the intention was to utilise abstract marks such as these, but in combination with recognisable aspects and forms from the selected urban landscapes.

Where my practice differed from these examples, and this was a key point in my practice led research, was that I then used these re-worked prints as a starting point for combination with other processes such as drawing and photography to allow layers of narrative to emerge of become more dominant to describe the peculiar, complex narratives, both personal and

---

public within the three cities of London, Luton and Istanbul. In addition to this I used the separate processes to describe variations in time and place of events which may have been traditionally drawn as linear within time to emerge one beneath or above the other so that narratives could seep through or become revealed beneath a torn fragment and become visually prominent and engaging.

Through this method I intended to develop and build upon the drawn aspect of previous practice (‘Land of the Lost’ and ‘Here to There’ Fig.4a, b). Purely drawn images, I intended to research how, on this scale, exploration of time sequences and narrative content could be developed through print when taking into consideration the inherent qualities of those processes. Other print work from my practice, which had touched on these concepts are from the series, ‘How did we get here?’ from 200829. These prints had explored the idea of frames of time, which were captured within one rectangular image. This I had achieved through the use of different print processes to describe different times; collograph to describe a human memory of a place; original print on antique book page to describe something further back in time and a digitally extracted area of print to describe a contemporary issue or concern. Although these prints had explored to some extent this concept of time frames and the ideas of playing within sequences of narrative, they were on a small scale and had not been combined with other processes such as photography.

29 Fairchild, A, ‘Where did we start, how did we get here, where will it end?’ Locus, at The Bath Festival, 2008,
Fig. 11 *Untitled*, Joan Mitchell, 1959/60

Fig. 12 *No, No, No*, Emilio Vedova, 1969
Fig. 13 ‘Istanbul’, Devrim Erbil

Fig. 14 ‘Istanbul’, Devrim Erbil
Using screen-printing to recreate the large drawings and then take them apart again seemed to allow for exploration into fusing two area of my practice. This fracturing of previously conceived drawn images combined with photographic records of the contemporary urban spaces I had chosen would seek to explore new models. Models for expressing the contemporary urban dilemma and the varied and fractured character of the city itself or the experience of its inhabitants could be established.

Examples I took as reference for this had viewed the city as a ‘living breathing entity’ with defining characteristics which were unique and its own. Devrim Erbil, a contemporary printmaker who ‘interprets Istanbul, a different face of which we see every day, in a linear style...He tells us the tale of a modern city hidden in its own history’. (Fig.13, 14)

This linear style and the use of contrasting bird’s eye view was one aspect of print I would explore, but with other more integrated aspects or viewpoints to interrogate whether the

---

30 http://english.istanbul.com/zoom/devrim-erbil-narrates-istanbul - accessed 15.07.10
question of visually communicating contemporary urban existence could be satisfied more authentically through a more combined model or through the creation of layers of narrative.

The process of multiples of a print also afforded my practice the opportunity to explore offsetting the images, slight changes in ink colour and the chance to reverse rotate areas to explore this as a tool to express ideas and suggest answers and new models for researching my question.

**Combinations of processes**

How could this combined experimental practice, creating new models which could evaluate, direct or inform the nature or content of the work, then be critically analysed and contextualised to become a body of research which could direct further practice? How also could these combinations ‘reveal hidden, lost or new layers of narrative or meaning’?

Approaching this part of the question a contemporary example of the ideas of integrated layers of meaning in the work of Palestinian artist Bashir Makhoul can be highlighted, for example, ‘Dust and Dispute’. (Fig.15) Makhoul has used successful and poignant combinations of historical and contemporary photography to create a new model of viewing a location imbued with personal, cultural and political history. Much of his work explores issues related to the Palestinian peoples’ heritage and the fractured history of that community. Themes such as ownership and belonging run through much of his work, as does the link between ‘now’, past and future. His combined works are constructed ‘to interrogate the layers of assumptions and meanings that are implicit in the images.’

If we take this as precedent for my own research, could my practice investigate and explore a wider variety of image combination and fragmentation (which could include tracing and drawing; recall from memory) layered to create a palimpsest, a way to explore and articulate the character and experiences within chosen urban centres.

My practice would, using Makhoul’s work as a precedent, differ from it by combining past and present events, combine both personal and wider experiences of chosen urban communities through a series of visual images using different working methods. Within this context responses could be created which could then be evaluated to establish their effectiveness and how these new insights could then be used further in my creative practice.

---

31 Fairchild, A Outside the Frame, Q2, Methodology, 2010
32 Biggs, L, Hold, 1999 – Leeds Metropolitan University Gallery, UK
To what extent could these combinations then reveal an exploration or description of time sequencing through the complex identities of several urban centres, which are specific in identity but with a more general reference to the contemporary human urban condition. Could some of the images be combined in ways to reveal layers of this condition regarding my own personal transition from one space/culture to another as well as a more general reference to the transitory and dislocated identities of the inhabitants of the chosen multi cultural urban centres of Istanbul, London, and Luton. The insights gained through critical analysis and contextualisation of this exploration formed the basis of my exploration and working methods and thus became the practice led research. The ongoing creative process was then directed by these insights gained through the unravelling and experimentation of the range of aspects within my practice.

The three urban centres
The choice of the three urban centres of London, Luton and Istanbul was based on personal experience as well as the fact that these centres contain strong cultural and visual contrasts.

The three spaces were chosen for contrasting reasons and the use of images from those cities directly relates to the reasons why they were chosen. Istanbul and Luton are more visually represented than London due to the fact that they are the two spaces I have personally lived in. London is the bridge between those two spaces.

Of the cities we know, the cities we inhabit are at least only inhabited often in tiny amounts. Yet it is these small, sharp or blurred fragments of imagery and personal memory, when selected which may describe our relationship to or being in those spaces. It can also create collections of stories about and between those spaces and the times in which we loved or remember them or are living in them in the present.

London
Whilst London was a city I had never lived in, it had featured in my journeys between two cities over a period of years and was an important bridge between those two places. London as a chosen city, although personal, was not one I had ever lived in. Therefore I do not have many personal lived memories, which I attach to it.

However, the choice of London as one of the three urban centres was a personal one in that for twelve years the city was a gateway between two other places, which I did live in. Whilst living in Istanbul this city was viewed mainly for me from the air. The space above the city
was full of the possibilities of the journey to another place, another city and another set of images. London was the bridge or crossing point for me from east to west, from Turkey to England or from west to east from England to Turkey. It was a point of departure, it was a space awaiting events and images, a place where the latest memories of one space were reflected on and taken to another city of great contrasts.

The photos I have used in this project do not reveal London visually at all but the sky above the city; the air space above London. (Fig. 49, 50) London was for me ‘the gateway between two contrasts’.

Luton

Luton was a city I have lived in recently, though I had not been familiar with it previously. It was an urban space I was becoming acquainted with by living in, walking around, navigating and observing.

Luton was a contrast for its examples of post modern suburban fragments of buildings and the corners of buildings, which could appear to be from ‘a’ city, ‘any’ city The pavements, street plans, facades and lost corners provide a contrast to the visually idiosyncratic metropolis of Istanbul. (Fig.43-48). The prefabricated paving stones, which would be familiar to many inhabitants of suburban Britain together with concrete relief facades such as the one in Fig.44 provided a real contrast to the more intimate and idiosyncratic visual architecture and spaces within Istanbul.

Istanbul

Istanbul is a city I have truly lived in and experienced. It was chosen as a place deeply rooted in personal memory and experience, which I lived in over a period of twelve years from the early 1990s onwards. It is a city I became very well acquainted with as well as one which I moved to and from over the twelve years and have returned to as a visitor many times since living back in England. It was a city I had a rich experience of living in lived and breathed as well as a city at times I was desperate to leave.

The photographs selected were from places I had walked past on many occasions. They were taken of areas I was very familiar with and yet had never photographed the ‘trace’ of that familiarity. It provided images, which show the idiosyncrasies of that place.

Istanbul is famous for being a bridge between east and west and an almost medieval city forcing its way out of a sprawling 21st century one developing at an almost inconceivably fast
rate. The decay of surfaces and of the changes in images, facades and the inevitable layering which occurs through this provided points of reference for how many of the images I was to make would be constructed.

One particular aspect of the city, which I chose to look at in some great detail, was of the Princess Islands, which lie off the coast of the city in the Marmara Sea. The islands are, for inhabitants of Istanbul, rich and poor alike a place of escape and yet offer some of the most stunning and compelling views of the city in all of Istanbul. The Great Island is a place of pilgrimage for some, where one can tie insignificant pieces of fabric, thread or paper to the branches of bushes and trees to make a wish. This idea and views from the islands towards Istanbul and back again formed the basis for two of the original pencil drawings used in the project. The ideas contained within these represent the memory of a sense of wanting to escape or leave and yet always being drawn back to return. The push and pull from here to there, which also symbolises Baudelaire's idea that we are always seeming to want to be in the place where we are not, described in the first chapter of this thesis.

These three urban spaces providing the visual and conceptual contrasts were to be combined together. This layering of ideas, visual images and drawn memories from each of the cities were to be combined to create new stories and connections and to reveal something about ones own being in relation to a space or place rather than the way that space or place is. So these idiosyncratic fragments, other images and memories combine in sometimes controlled, sometimes serendipitous ways to create new connections and stories unravelling from within the visual contrasts of the chosen urban spaces.

Layering towards the palimpsest

I began to explore how these unravelling narratives were occurring through a layering and combination and how they could be explored and analysed in regard the relationship of present events to past or future ones. How could this be expressed through combinations of the complementary processes of drawing and screen-print with the selective addition of photography?

Through this selective as well as serendipitous occurrence and combination of the processes of drawing, screen-printing and collage, many more layers of meaning and questioning of
how a palimpsest could occur began to emerge. Unfolding layering of events, images and memories through time were combined with photography signalling another avenue to my practice, which again through evaluation and analysis would form the basis for this next stage of the research. Importantly here, this emerging palimpsest began to offer new insights into how non-linear narratives arrived at through new connections through its layers could describe or articulate urban environments, in new ways. Through the new visual connections, which could be made within these occurring palimpsests, changes in meaning or narrative were revealed. These were then evaluated and accepted as descriptive of the of the urban environments or a personal response to them and became part of a collection of tangentially occurring narratives.

As the curator David Elliot states, ‘The history of modernity has been written as a linear narrative privileging the inevitability of the present’. He goes on to suggest that ‘the discontinuous, chaotic and polyvalent activity of making art has never supported this view.’ Creative exploration may be perfectly placed to access new ways to describe our contemporary urban narrative and visual images articulating something more complex and possibly poetic through a revealed palimpsest structure could be more akin to what Elliot describes when he says, ‘What has been put in its place is an idea of history and culture as a field or matrix in which many different links can be made across time and space.’

These links across time and space create a matrix through the depth of the images and can therefore be read as a palimpsest occurring through layers of images. This was a key point in the project revealing narratives through a palimpsest of taken apart and/or erased or missing visual images within one actual time frame, yet outside the framework of sequential linear images.

An investigation into erasure as both destructive and constructive and a foundation for the creation of such a palimpsest began to emerge in the project.

The painter Robert Rauschenberg’s observations of his own work in this field in 1953 with his piece ‘Erased de Kooning drawing’ stated that this was an investigation into “whether a

drawing could be made out of erasing. In relation to my own research, could one drawing be (un) made through erasure leaving a space for the next layering of the palimpsest to emerge? Throughout the deconstructive and reconstructive process of making the prints and collages this was a key method used to assess how this could aid, alter and develop narrative structures and time references within images.

Two examples of this kind of visual analysis of how images could relate to each other across time and space are as follows;

Firstly where Roland Barthes declares, “The background exists fully as an object that has already lived”. That is to say we may take textures, or images from urban environments or objects found within those or other settings to use as a basis for creative investigation. We are not starting with a blank canvas, instead we are starting with something which has narrative embedded within it, a narrative which has truly been lived by the object. This could be photographic images, found materials, objects etc. However, it could also be a story told or a memory recalled, which may be highly personal. Within the surfaces of many of the larger prints and collages in this project are both of these types of surfaces (objects), which have lived.

The photographs of Serge Clement explore this kind of layering of existing surface where one viewpoint encapsulates a multitude of lived fragments and somehow where one city may be any city. (Fig.16, 17)

In Egyptian/German artist Susan Hefuna’s, ‘Woman Behind a Mashrabiya’ this work uses existing photographs imbued with their own history. These are combined with other intricate surfaces creating poetic and descriptive mysteries. (Fig.18). Mysteries pertaining to personal internal narratives in contrast to the external world and articulate the complexities of colliding beliefs or cultures.

Objects such as books are incorporated into the paintings of John Latham and become part of a new surface creating both visual and conceptual narratives. (Fig.19)

---

*A Mashrabiya is a screen made from wood which can only be seen through from the internal space outwards.
Secondly, once this object is in existence, to what extent can erasure question and experiment? As Richard Galpin states where the aim is not the obliteration of that character, ‘...but rather it is a means of gaining new knowledge about that character or thing which is (fictionally) killed or erased, and gaining new knowledge about the process of death or erasure itself.’

---

Therefore, in terms of this project, how new understanding of the urban locations in both a personal or historical or community sense could be extracted through the erasing of areas or the combining of fragments across images could then reveal a new method of creating images. This history of an image would use as a model something which Richard Galpin notes when he says “the positive/negative assertion and intention that all images are “inevitably polluted by the traces of the background”.37 Using this as a basis, yet unsubscribing to the idea of ‘pollution’ as a ‘dirty’ word. Rather it is, in a conceptual sense, the meaningful visual trace left by urban environments or communities; a trace, which reveals a physically visual nature or identity to urban developments or events within place and time.

Could these visual identities or documents be used to analyse the relationship between chosen contrasting urban environments through a series of urban surfaces where posters have become part of the context of a wall or space providing a naturally deconstructed palimpsest of events? Could these provide the basis for a visual answer to the question of

whether an antidote to the violence of the advanced, urban, industrial environment could be generated anew?

Analysis and Evaluation

Analysis and evaluation was key to understanding how aspects of my practice could be explored and developed to describe the complexities of the urban spaces I had chosen. This analysis and evaluation was used to gain new insights into individual and combined aspects of my practice, which would then enable those aspects to become research ways to investigate personal memories together with present traces of a place can be used through narrative structures to describe complex urban experience and identity.

This section looks at analysis and dismantling or the taking apart of aspects of the initial three drawn images through printmaking, collage and tracing. It explores how a variety of methods and tools of practice have impacted on the nature of the work produced and also defined the direction of the project towards new, extensive and explorative work.

Three Sequential Drawings; Wish Tree Hill; Lost Things; Here to There
The starting point for the relationships between the three sequential drawings was a return in some respects to narrative structure of beginning, middle and end first looked at in my work during 2008. The drawings ‘Wish Tree Hill’, ‘Lost Things’ and ‘Here to There’ were made as a sequence of images where the beginning of the sequence is not clearly defined. However there is a narrative structure, which can be seen to run in a linear way through the sequence.

In 2008 my series of work for ‘Locus’ at the Bath Festival curated by the Irish artist and curator Daphne Wright titled ‘Where did we start, How did we get here, Where will it end?’ (Fig.20) was the catalyst for an idea of re-interpretation and a series of works whose linear order and arrangement could be varied to explore deconstruct narrative and question ideas of the relationship or order of events in time events in space and time and together with the philosophical ideas of the connection between the past future and its links to our present place or point in time. The question then us posing the question ed of where do we start? How does the narrative structure alter when the sequence of these events is altered or we begin our narrative at a different point in the sequence? This was also intended to explore the idea of unique interpretations of the same event where, due to the viewer or curators’ recall of memory or experience, variations on the sequence of events could be exhibited and also interpreted. In some cases this meant omitting one or more of the prints in any given hanging reinterpreted by the curators as if lost or even irrelevant at that point or place in time. In relation to the research question that to what extent combinations of process could communicate the concept of ‘now’ as a future memory each hanging was set against the backdrop/history of the ones both preceding and following it. Any curator or viewer undoubtedly gives his/her own significance to images or elements within them based on personal experience, context time and place the work is viewed at. Berger talks about this concept in ‘Between two Colmars,’ his writing on viewing the Grunewald altarpiece; the same work, read under two different conditions, firstly ‘as evidence of the past’s despair’ and then as ‘miraculously offering a narrow path across despair.’ The difference being that ten years had passed between the first and second viewings. That is to say Berger had been forced to place himself in a different relationship with history and time.

38 Berger, J, Between two Colmars in About Looking, 1980, New York
As a viewer giving one’s own significance to the objects being viewed is an interesting point to discuss.

“I see a dead tree outside a city or a town. Seeing the mosques and minarets I can say this is a Muslim city. Seeing the water dividing the drawing and separating the city and the hill which the tree is planted I can almost say this is Istanbul. But I am from Istanbul and I know what “wish tree” is. Maybe I am not objective for this question.”

This seemed to be a key point in the research and one, which was to underpin the outcomes of the project.

There was still at this point an analysis of narratives, albeit not necessarily reading from the same starting point read in a linear fashion. Altering the order of images even within this linear format had given rise to the question of what were the critical elements within any given series of images. In fact how could the meaning of any particular element within an image gain more or less significance when placed in a different position within a sequence?

The return to this structure as a starting point seemed appropriate as a tool to answer the research question. The small works on paper from ‘Locus’ had explored combinations of print alluding to different time frames so that the use of each type of print process was representative of a point in past, present or future. Throughout the progression of the research project it proved to be pivotal to the question of how reduction, addition or repetition of content within the images that an addition of screen-print could be then combined with other print and drawing processes to establish to what extent this part of the question in relation to past, present and future events could be answered. This could reinforce some narrative aspects already contained within the images, which referred to this.

“In this drawing we look at the “wish tree” from the other side. The separating bulk of water is back and now we are in the city, looking back at the wish tree, probably reminiscing about the lost things or our past. Seems like it is a different time though, for the tree is in bloom.”

“Notepaper can also be used as a vehicle to jolt a bad recall of memory – leaving post-its to oneself on the fridge door or keeping a diary etc”

39 Unal, U, Outside the Frame Responses, 2011
40 Unal, U, Outside the Frame Responses, 2011
41 Archer, P, Outside the Frame Responses, 2011
So, to use aspects of my previous practice on a smaller scale in relation to larger poster format size was the next avenue of exploration.

The beginning of this process of working on a large poster sized scale with graphite on paper was based on my previous graphic work for the film ‘Ara’ in 2008. Here the combination of a drawn remembered space had been combined with a photographic image of the ‘real’ space of the film set’s narrative.
‘Film posters for unrealised projects’ from 2009 (Fig. 4a, 4b) also used this way of working. Here, however, the two images were constructed around the concept of a non-existent series of events outside the frame of the posters.

When beginning the graphite drawings for the research project a new approach was taken from the start, that they be conceived as a set of three, relating to the concept of sequential series of events in time as a starting point; three parts to a triptych; a series of three events. Within the framework of the concept of these three sequential images was the relationship between two urban spaces, real or remembered, the journey back and forth between two radically contrasting urban cultural locations. Further to this it was conceived that other processes of photography and print be used in combination with the drawings to add dimensions of other visited and revisited urban environments.

These three drawings are based largely on personal memory recall and part in constructed visual narrative references, which allude to traditional ideas about the use of foreground, middle distance and horizon especially with regard to landscape and notions of past, present and future and memory as well as intangibility.

The concept was to link the three images in a continuous format so that, in effect, one could start viewing them in any order and there would still be a readable sequence within them. This included placing related objects or recognisable views into the drawings to create some kind of reference or threads for the constructed narratives and a sense of time passing between the drawings.

One main concept within the relationship between the drawings as the foundation for research was the extent to which these images could reflect the speed of contemporary urban change and its impact on the inhabitants of these spaces. However, it is obvious when viewing these drawings that they contain very little visual representation of urban space or any actual human presence within them.

The approach here regarding this was to take more of an emotional and conceptual approach? So that if the drawings only contained minimal visual material from the urban environment, then the dilemma of existence within the modern urban environment, the urban condition, could be more successfully alluded to through other metaphorical references.

These metaphors for the urban human condition could then be combined with traditional, more visually representational aspects of landscape and horizon in themselves alluding to intangibility and creating new narratives. Main elements of the natural world were added in
significant ways to the visual structure in order to offer some other ‘explanation’ or hidden reality, which would be a metaphor for the experience of contemporary urban communities. So, contained within the visual narrative structure of these three drawn part real and part invented landscapes were to be some ascribed values of other intangible spiritual associations alluding to the urban environments. For example the absence of a visual human presence within the three images becomes a metaphor for the anonymity and possible feelings of alienation within urban spaces. Another example of this metaphor creating narrative is within the drawing ‘Lost Things’ where we can see lost items such as a book, keys and a child’s toy. These can be seen as metaphors of parts of a life lost or collective lost storyline; shelter, innocence respectively. The complex horizon lines within ‘Lost Things’ refers to ideas researched within the concept of landscape and memory it seemed possible, as writer Ken Taylor suggests in his essay of the same title, that “Landscape therefore is not simply what we see, but a way of seeing: we see it with our eye but interpret it with our mind and ascribe values to landscape for intangible – spiritual – reasons.”

Having discussed the links in narrative between the three original drawings it is important here to focus on one key aspect which links all three works.

The use of landscape with ideas of foreground, middle distance and far horizon was central to the construction of all three drawings as were references to the historical use of landscape and in particular the horizon in two-dimensional imagery in art as a metaphor for the intangible. John Berger describes this in his analysis of the history and changed ideas about landscape painting during the 18th century onwards with the observation that “From the seventeenth century onwards exceptional innovators in terms of vision and therefore technique were Ruysdael and Rembrandt...furthermore, their innovations led progressively away from the substantial and tangible towards the indeterminate and intangible.”

Use of foreground and background, close-up observation and use of horizon have all been explored within the three initial drawings to include metaphorical aspects to the images and reflect ideas of the intangible.

In terms of the use of urban representation within the drawings, it was intended that some reference be made to the urban landscape within the initial three drawings, but that this

43 Berger, J, Ways of Seeing, 2008, England
would then be built upon as the research project progressed. As the drawings began to be taken apart through the screen print process other map traces or mis-registered elements of discarded repeated prints start to be embedded within the work, this gave rise to a variety of approaches for understanding and viewing the urban environment. Here the concept of varying views of the same urban space began to refer to ideas in the work of people such as the Palestinian artists Bashir Makhlo (referenced above) and Turkish artist Devrim Erbil who "presents Istanbul, which he interprets from the bird’s eye view, as a ‘City of enthusiasm’. He combines the poetry in his paintings with the traditional. What becomes in the end is a tale city”44

It was intended to capture from the cities in question some of these tales hoping to reveal more about the way cities are inhabited than their actual physical reality.

This began to answer the question of how drawn images of landscape and memory could act as a platform for expressing both a personal or community experience of displacement combined with a more historical visual record of memory or experience. That is to say to what extent varying types of representation or records of the urban/inhabited environment within one image more accurately express some of these ideas.

Visual descriptions of real places and memories of those and other places combined may exist within one frame, but how are these visual records of events linked across a sequence of images which can have more than one beginning, middle or ending. The following section looks at how this occurred within the three original sequenced drawings.

**Analysis of linear narrative structure and the relationship between the three images**

Narrative through recall of memory of events in time and space has been constructed within the three drawings to create meaning and direct a chain of events, which is forever linked in a cyclic format. Particularly poignant in relation to the urban environment and as Susan Sontag describes, ‘Only that which narrates can make us understand’.45 In effect, if we have something to communicate, then some form of narrative may be necessary.

---

45 Berger, J, About Looking, Susan Sontag on photography, 1991, USA
In relation to the concept of communication of movement and narrative structure within the three drawings, the centre of focus of each drawing has also been designed to re-enforce some returning notions of our locus on a continuum. However, this is not to say that a narrative should always read as linear and that narratives can be revealed through layers or by returning to previous images within a series of works.

The first drawing (Fig. 22) has the foreground and details of the tree and its branches as the centre of our focus. The second image is more ambiguous and seemingly asks the viewer to search around the image again and again passing from the foreground to the background, lost, in essence, as the title suggests. The third drawing, although detailed in the foreground uses combinations of blurred foreground drawing and dynamics of text and layout to direct the focus towards the tree on the horizon. This construction sends us back conceptually to the horizon and the journey on which we have come since the first drawing. This reference to the horizon as a metaphor for the intangible has been used as far back as the 16th Century in landscape painting.

In terms of narrative sequencing it was intended that the three drawings be seen as images in their own right, but that they are also part of a series where the landscape is familiar or where there are objects found within the drawings, which create meaning between the three works.

This may be in terms of objects or landscapes, which are re-visited. Objects appear to have been re-visited referring to events in time so that they are "...temporally related to one another instead of speaking of certain events as "occurring in time"."46

The file, which appears in both the first and the last of the three drawings represents this shift in time as we believe that "...An object can be in one place at two times only if it also occupies all the time in between, whether at that same place or another, and it must

46 Fumerton, R and Jeske, D, Introducing Philosophy through Film, 2010, England
accordingly have some temporal length. Otherwise we find that we are talking about two objects and not one.”47

In terms of frozen fragments of time stilled from events outside the framework of a strictly linear narrative I was much influenced at this point by the work of filmmaker and photographer Andrei Tarkovsky who “developed a theory of cinema that he called “sculpting in time.” By this he meant that the unique characteristic of cinema as a medium was to take our experience of time and alter it...he aimed to give the viewers a sense of time passing, time lost, and the relationship of one moment in time to another. I was investigating how narratives of events could be visually articulated from a variety of time frames and places through the act of ‘sculpting in time’ within two-dimensional images.

The text in ‘Wish Tree Hill’ casts a long, almost unnatural shadow onto the hill referencing gates or divisions and twilight shadows used by Tarkovsky in his research Polaroid photograph. (Fig. 23)

In the initially presented first A1 poster samples the added ‘events’ text at the top and bottom of the design is set up to re-enforce this notion of beginnings and/or endings.

The central tree image on the hill is bare or even ‘dead, perhaps with the weight of the burden of wishes tied upon it”48, which when seen in contrast to the third image where the tree has shoots/leaves. Some time has clearly passed before or since – at least the length of one season, possibly more. This is designed to again direct us back and forth between one place of land and another. This idea is to set up a sense of migration or displacement, which references the contemporary urban dilemma and the transitional identities of cities and their inhabitants.

In addition to this the filmmaker David Claerbout uses ideas of parallel notions of time where we view two sequences at the same location but we are unsure as to which has happened before of after. In relation to my project and in particular the content of the three initial drawings, I will explore how this non-linear notion of time could be constructed and explored within the idea of a sequence of three images.

47 Fumerton, R and Jeske, D, Introducing Philosophy through Film, 2010, England

48 Schaffer, A, Outside the Frame Responses, Oct 2011
Christophe Gallois in his introduction to Claerbout’s installation at Hauser and Wirth Gallery, London in 2009 describes this dilemma by quoting Saint Augustine from ‘what then is time? If no one asks me, I know. If I wish to explain to someone who asks, I no longer know.’\(^{49}\) However, visual images have qualities, which verbal explanations cannot convey. They are filled with personal and communal references to experiences of time and place other than the one in which they exist. They are sensual like a remembered combination of smells.

In regard to the relating experience across contrasting contemporary urban environments:

‘The trees are the focal point. Depending on the location, the tree tells us how healthy the urban neighbour is across the water. The artist also uses the paper in each drawing to connect us to the mood and the feeling of each drawing.’\(^{50}\)

\(^{49}\) Gallois, C, http://www.frieze.com/shows/review/david_claerbout/ accessed 18.01.11

\(^{50}\) Ross, C, Outside the Frame Responses, 2011
Drawing One – ‘Wish Tree Hill’ (Reflective analysis taken from my journal)

The following extracts are taken directly from my reflective journal. They are the analysis and evaluation of each stage of the practice engaged in and the insights gained from this analysis were a working method, which formed the basis of my research methods upon which further creative practice was based.

It was used in conjunction with questionnaire research analysis from other artists and writers across a spectrum from screenplay writers to novelists, painters and photographers.

The foreground of Wish Tree hill is highly detailed therefore becoming a focus for our attentions. This is where we, the viewer, begin to identify with the narrative yet are placed outside the frame of the visual narrative. We immediately identify with the “human” representational element in the form of the open file. As the pages of the file have been deliberately left open, we are left slightly adrift and this places us in an intentionally precarious position. Had the ring binder been left closed, we would have felt more secure; pages could not be blown away by the weather etc. Added to this we may feel we could turn our heads and nothing would have changed within a short space of time. Our position may have remained exactly as we had left it. This fragility of our ‘locus’ in the here and now on a broader continuum seems to make us uneasy – if only we could wish we were somewhere else? Can we be metaphorically transported through existential desire or longing for the ‘somewhere else’. The wishing ribbons of belief and prayer are tied to the twisted and thorny branches of the real space we inhabit. One existential space entwined within another physical reality. Our focus is concentrated on this area within the drawing all surrounding the open file of ‘where do we go from here?’ That is to say there is a community of narrative constructed by the many ribbons tied to the branches of the tree. Each one tied by a different person yet each for a similar belief. There is a history of time created by the leaving of the ribbons. The implication here being that this is a ritualistic activity.

Throughout the research project I had noted various types of this kind of belief system in both the UK and Turkey of making an addition to some natural object in a given place. The places selected have some significance which can be either related to a set of belief systems or because the chosen site has some great other significance of early civilisation such as sites of standing stones or areas of significant fossilisation. Examples such as a typical ‘Wishing tree’ from Goreme in Turkish Central Anatolia (Fig.24) where fragments of fabric, paper or threads have been attached to the branches of a small tree. The tree has become almost
swamped with devotional artefacts. Standing within the same area is another example of a similar object, traditional, locally made unfired ceramic pots having been added to the tree. Ceramic objects from central Anatolia have been used since early civilisation in this area for functional objects as well as for making fertility symbols and are particularly female in their form. (Fig.25)

Another example of a system of improvised belief is the Bucket Tree situated in Dorset in the UK. (Fig.26) The buckets appear to have been washed up on the local coastline, lost or discarded. This collection of similar objects attached to a tree reminds us of the nature of our own mortality and that we all share in some similar existential enquiry.

On a similar note examples are often found of more spontaneous, improvised placing of natural objects upon natural objects in the form of stones. These may sometimes be smaller stones from the immediate area of the site or others, which may have been brought into the area. Sites in this case are often of cultural significance and relate to some establishment of settlement areas, or they are of pre-historical importance. Here the emphasis is on more of a totemic placing of objects a signifier for collective statement of the recognition of the place. For example, the placing of small fragments of rock on the fossilised stump of a tree from the Jurassic period in Lulworth Cove, Dorset makes a statement of collective recognition of the fact that humans were not witness to the time itself, but is witness now to that very same fact. The tree itself is greater than us and it is recognition of our own mortality. The relationship to these kinds of beliefs and the recognition of our mortal ‘locus’ on a greater continuum is exactly one of the concepts evoked in the drawing ‘Wish Tree Hill’.
The folder is also here again in the third image, but this time it has on one page the beginning or end of a route map or set of directions drawn onto it. Can this imply that we are again at another junction in time? Some reference here to the still life photography of the Russian
filmmaker Andrei Tarkovsky is made in the shadow of the text as object cast on the hillside; the twilight of time between day and night or between the end of one chapter and the beginning of another.

No human presence is visible, only being alluded to visually in the following ways; the open file in a position of transience identifies an individual presence; the wish knots tied to the branches identifying a unifying or common factor in a set of beliefs; the distant city on the horizon identifying the contemporary urban post modern dilemma; a condition viewed on the horizon. The hill represents more of a historical and personal human space in contrast to the landscape in the distance. Between these two spaces lies an expanse of water with ships passing between the city and back again, alluding to the space between our personal journey and a contemporary post modern dilemma.

‘The tree is on an island separated from the urban landscape by water, which might be interpreted as a metaphor for urban life deserting its connection with nature.’

‘The demise of life in the urban city... wishes unfulfilled... empty pages in diaries...life has become a sad, dead blank. Our wishes are an island separate from our lives. The concept of the I Ching comes to mind…with the reference of crossing the water meaning imminent danger. Here, it could be the separateness of human life. Religious buildings add to this feeling of separation. There is an element of competitiveness too, all buildings vying for space.’


Drawing two – ‘Lost Things’ (Reflective analysis taken from journal)

Through a glade of trees we observe, with difficulty, three horizon lines in the distance; (Fig.8) the edge of the nearest break of trees; the edge of the wood; the far horizon. We are naturally drawn to a horizon in real view or in re-constructed views. It is the farthest the eye can see and represents rising up on two legs with a concept that there is something beyond our immediate surroundings.

The centre of our focus in the second of the three drawn images is the mid point where a branch crosses the trees. Our view is obscured somewhat by the trees and we attempt to establish a reference point for ourselves on one of the broken

51 Archer, P, Outside the Frame, Responses, 2011
52 Ross, C, Outside the Frame, Responses, 2011
horizons – broken by the nature of the trees crossing our view at right angles. We appear to be moving in a direction towards the ever-receding three horizon lines.

Have we been here before?
Have we lost here the same object?
Do all the objects belong to one person?
These are questions the drawing poses.

The trees

The trees in this drawing are from a landscape, which is different to the first and third drawings. Thus setting it slightly apart from the other two.

Lost objects
The three lost objects are keys, a child’s soft toy, spectacles and one book left open. All these objects have been selected to allude to various ideas of loss
Keys; reference to returning and non-returning
Soft toy; lost childhood, innocence
Spectacles; metaphor for lost youth and the mortality of our existence
A Book; Lost narrative or structure and the contemporary urban human condition.

‘The teddy is uncomfortable for me. Lost childhood...Probably more likely, in the woods we want to escape. But we cannot.’53

‘The lost book or notebook can be read in many ways such as one’s personal records, one’s diary or valuable past is lost.’54

These symbols of loss or mortality reference ideas in paintings such as Holbein’s ‘The Ambassadors’, 1533, (Fig.28) where Memento Mori are apparent. Objects seemingly alien to the image are inserted to provide an outside-the-frame reference to our mortality even though we are looking at an immortal image.
In some reflective sense the drawing is saying to us in its own analysis, 'I am aware, I am optimistic of the future horizon even though I am aware'. Andrei Tarkovsky the Russian

53 Ross, C, Outside the Frame Responses, 2011
54 Unal, U, Outside the Frame Responses, 2011
photographer and filmmaker describes this when he observes that, 'Artistic creation is by
definition a denial of death. Therefore it is optimistic, even if in an ultimate sense the artist is
tragic.'\textsuperscript{55}

The idea within the middle of the three drawn images was to place us continually in the lost
present.

Repeated images of the same object can alter our perception of time. As David Hume
observes, 'Thus the principle of individuation is nothing but the invariableness and
uninterruptedness of any object, thro’ a suppos’d variation of time, by which the mind can
trace it in the different periods of its existence, without any break of the view, and without
being obligh’d to form the idea of multiplicity or number.'\textsuperscript{56}

The Text

The text within this drawing is selected to represent a twist on a circus font. (Fig.10) Selected
to represent the passing of a temporary event, which has been and gone. Circus performers
have passed through and, indeed, perhaps they have left objects behind on more than one
occasion, remnants of their nomadic existence. Our place in the mid point of the continuum is
re-enforced by this idea of a temporary encampment.

'The big title forces us to believe that these are "lost objects", not just
junk or thrown away objects.'\textsuperscript{57}

\textsuperscript{55} Tarkovsky, A, Instant Light, p. 63, 2008, England
\textsuperscript{56} Hume, D, Eumerton, R and Jeske, D, Introducing Philosophy through Film, p 83, 2010, England
\textsuperscript{57} Unal, U, Outside the Frame Responses, 2011
Fig. 27 *Lost Things*, Anna Fairchild

Fig. 28 *The Ambassadors*, Hans Holbein, 1533
Fig. 29 Circus font

Fig. 30 Here to There, Anna Fairchild
Drawing three – ‘Here to There’

Although the foreground of this drawing is detailed, we are still drawn to the distance where we can recognise again the tree from the first drawing in the series. Even without seeing the first drawing we are aware of the coming and going of the two ships and the text title. (Fig.11)

The text

“Here to There” reads from left to right, but has also been designed with the word ‘There’ tilted upwards so that it reads from right to left re-enforcing the idea of moving backwards and forwards, or a return journey. Implications of a cyclic journey linking image three to the first image in the series. Allusions also to the notion of causality and to what extent present actions can be sufficient for past events. These symbols within this drawing having been included to reveal new sequential structures which may in turn inform the direction of the work. As part of the series of poster images for the research project these drawings being individually conceived to offer in varying order some alternative narrative time sequence for
advertised events within the posters ‘since the turning about of our head, or the shutting of our eyes is able to break it (the image).’\textsuperscript{58}

The existential yearning for a place other than where we are now is implied, a sense of displacement. Some resolution to the narrative contained within the three images, yet at the same time an open-ended locus or present tense on a never-ending continuum.

The tree
The tree is newly in leaf since we encountered it in the first drawing. Time can be observed to have passed before or since. This can be seen to be altering the sequence of time within the images. Suggestions are made here that the narrative may be working in reverse order and that this third image can indeed be seen as the first one in the series of three.

The open file and drawn directions

The file, which has been placed on a stone seat looking out across the water to the tree on the island on the horizon, seems almost welded to the stone seat by the shadow cast by the branches at the far right of the image. Using this to allude to the concept of looking both forwards and backwards in time, we are both here and there; both placed and displaced. The transient nature of a shadow is often used in drawing and photography to highlight the impermanence of the present. The Russian, Andrei Tarkovsky, who is one of the few filmmakers to have equally a body of still photographic work utilises this to serious melancholic effect in his Polaroid shots of still lives and research scenes for his films. Pages float both to and from the island tracing the steps of the journeys back and forth. On these pages we can see drawings in the form of map like directions and notes, which have been made alongside these. We seem to be placed within the continuum of the journey back and forth rather than seated in a position on the bench, as the seat and file are both overgrown and appear to have remained in the same position for some time.

\textsuperscript{58} Fumerton, R and Jeske, D, Introducing Philosophy through Film, 2010, England
Throughout the history of drawing and painting the process of natural projection of present objects or images has been used to bring another world outside the viewed frame into the one being viewed. This trace of the real as only the real can be viewed where there is light present almost transports us from one time and space into another. The photographic artist Abelardo Morell uses this pinhole camera method of working, utilising entire rooms where one space and set of meanings is apparent. Bringing the outside space into the interior is at revealing about otherwise unseen location and at times also surprising when the content appears to be how we least expect it. This inversion of one space into another sets a metaphorical or dreamlike narrative up within the framework of what actually exists.

The plants and natural material that, appears to have overgrown the bench have been drawn using the method of projection described previously, created using actual shadows cast by real objects in the form of grasses and plants. (Fig.31) The idea here being that the drawings made from these would have an out-of-focus quality about them so that the focus of the viewer would be directed to the tree in the distance, creating the sense of movement to and from the foreground of the drawing and linking this third image back to the first one ‘Wish Tree Hill’. The focus here is also on the horizon reference and the concept of intangibility. Intangibility of our present place in time is also re-enforced here through the placement of the file on the stone seat. Across the world communities devise ways in which they can attempt to quantify the intangible ideas which arise such as what else is there other than the here and now? In this drawing the concept lies behind the placing of objects, such as stones left behind by an obvious human presence. (Fig.32)

“We observe the first drawing from the opposite angle. But there is another book on this side too. Probably this is a current book, not “lost” as the other one. This might imply the person behind the drawings is someone who keeps books/notebooks and they are valuable for them.”59

Although the three drawings were made separately it is important to state here that there are strong elements of one drawing within another and another and so on. It is clear from the reflective analysis that the drawings have been made with reference to each other and indeed to the time frame each was made in. Links were created whilst drawing and ongoing analysis made from one drawing would definitely have impacted on the others.

59 Unal, U, Outside the Frame Responses, 2011
As the drawings were constructed so elements within them were given more or less importance to focus on areas of developing narrative.

The first drawing was constructed initially because it seemed furthest back in personal memory. However, it may take a different place in a given sequence of the drawings because its importance may diminish or become more pronounced or only elements of that drawing may indeed be of value when the development of more complex narratives is explored.

Indeed, even as the artist, I am also the viewer and serendipitous occurrences within the frames of the drawings may have led me to search for further sources of reference during the time period in which they were made. An example of this is the discovery of other forms of wishing tree in Anatolia, Turkey and Dorset, England during the making of the ‘Wish Tree Hill’ drawing. The analysis within my reflective journal whilst making these drawings allowed me to step out of the constructed narrative and become the viewer/author of a variety of new narratives with the time of viewing becoming part of my examination of the narratives.

In order to investigate how the narratives within this series of images could further be examined and revealed to combine with other processes it was necessary to find ways to accentuate aspects of the images. It also had become apparent through the actual process of making the work that some elements were pivotal to an understanding of how the three images interrelated. How was it best to identify and draw out these aspects? Based on past drawing work for posters including the ‘Ara’ film poster and both ‘Land of the Lost’ and ‘Gidis Donus’, I decided to continue the practice-led investigation by applying the use of chiaroscuro through drawing to screen-printed versions of the drawings.

A true analysis through deconstruction, evaluation and reconstruction of these three drawings, became critical to the development of the research project. The following-section looks at how the processes of print as well as the addition of collage and tracing were used as working methods to focus on and deconstruct these drawings. It will identify ongoing analysis and evaluation together with qualitative responses from a series of questionnaires to establish the most successful from a series of alternative visual narrative structures towards a new series of posters and drawings. It also begins to evaluate to what extent these research models and the images produced from them have been successful in answering the thesis questions.
Drawing on the analysis of all three drawings it was evident that there had been initial intentions constructing a narrative within each image as well as between the three images when making the drawings, but that also during the process of making them ideas had fed from the other drawings so that the narrative had become woven between them. Spontaneous decisions about the construction of the drawings, for example the tracing of plant shadows using sunlight directly onto the third drawing had added a new dimension, which had not been realised up to that point. The lost objects in the second drawing had been decided upon whilst making the drawing relating to objects found at the time of making. The actual view through the woods in the second drawing was taken from a new location with which I was not so personally familiar and this meant that a more focussed act of observation in the present had occurred whilst making the drawing. Within this drawing also are several horizons used to reference the repeat of the complex struggle with the intangible, but which had become a focus due to the nature of the location of the actual wood and the views presented to me at the location itself. The actual location, in effect, had contributed to how the narrative structure was constructed. This kind of analysis was to become the focus for investigation through the use of chiaroscuro.

The initial focus for research through analysis and deconstruction of the printed versions of the original three drawings was on darkening areas of the images using chiaroscuro. Taking as example Rembrandt’s ‘The Woman Taken in Adultery’ from 1644 (Fig.33) with its theatrical operatic and grandiose use of light and dark highlighting and taking the compositional structure as a precedent. The woman, isolated within a pool of light, focuses attention upon the character’s disposition and a singular point in time within a longer narrative. Other small areas within the painting are also bathed in light to direct our attention compositionally around the image and continue to hint at narrative structures and drama.

This leaning towards drama and events within a narrative was the starting point for experimenting with the use of chiaroscuro with versions of the three drawings.

Using large swathes of graphite to obscure some areas and highlight others, the intention was to explore this dramatic aspect to construct new narratives or connect existing ones within the three poster drawings. Using this method, areas became identified and/or highlighted as linking forces between the three drawings creating new emphasis and
meanings. In essence a different series of events could be created to project the narrative in one or other direction.

However, reflective analysis suggested that this seemed to be too theatrical a method, spotlighting only certain areas to the complete exclusion of others. Rather than revealing new structures or possibilities, these images were technically too dark to be combined with other mediums such as collage or photography, giving rise to the problem of being unable to answer successfully the question through combinations of processes. In order to achieve this, other avenues would need to be explored. So, more focussing on what could be revealed through erasure and the absence became key to further research. As opposed to presence and ‘spotlighting’ of some areas representing the landscape or notion of the city and its inhabitants, erasure seemed to be key to revealing ‘lost or new layers of narrative or meaning’.60 This diversion from the research plan along with the anticipated need to deconstruct and fragment the drawings in line with revealing hidden layers meant that the research then progressed through erasure, fragmentation and collage and lightening areas of the drawings rather than through this previously anticipated use of darkening and obscuring areas through chiaroscuro.

Within this change of direction to the project many new interesting links and connecting narrative structures began to emerge. Some of these were enlarged and formed the basis for some further research into screen-printing areas of the drawings, in particular from ‘Wish Tree Hill’. These could then be reconstructed as if three dimensionally extending from within the two-dimensional space of the image. Elements of these prints were then added through collage back into the printed works. Something here of a three-dimensional palimpsest alternative structure, which could describe a spatial tapestry, could be the framework to support or suspend a collection of constructed objects. Although some combination had begun to occur, it still appeared quite limited and didn’t offer the possibility of much combination with photographic elements due to the dark nature of the images.

A general move towards discarding the use of chiaroscuro and more of experimentation towards the idea of a palimpsest, which could occur through erasure and reconstruction, became evident.

---

60 Fairchild, A, Outside the Frame, Methodology, Q2, p.1, 2010
As I have referenced previously mentioning Jacques Derrida’s ideas of deconstruction, the use of erasure, both intentional and serendipitous could be used to disrupt the established pictorial structure of the images and the narrative or stories within them so that the absent elements would subvert the language of the developing images and allow new layers of connections and narratives to occur through the surface of the images.

Perhaps lightened or clouded areas could be used more successfully, giving rise to concepts and ideas of the absence of a memory or its loss over time. It could also begin to refer to selective memories, describing something about what is beneath the areas, which were obscured. Could this entice the viewer to look further into those areas, search for meaning or narrative, left unexplained or ambiguous? With the screen-printing process as a focus for the research within the drawings, some absence or erasure would be seen as revealing former presence. The opportunity could then arise in the erased areas for other processes of print, tracing and collage from other times or place to be added revealing more about how the various urban locations could be linked and reflect some of the ideas of contrast of accelerated change. Not only this, but with these new reconstructions an antidote to the violence of the advanced, urban, industrial environment could be articulated with addition of the more immediate tool of drawing, of aspects of the ‘urban’ narrative could create ‘contrasts’ or ‘antidotes’. Indeed layers of past or future embedded in the present framework of the image. This process of print could also be supplemented by obscuring some of the prints by spray paint, with some references to graffiti within the urban environments. This revealing through erasure as part of creative practice, allowing for development of a palimpsest proved invaluable as ‘...that crossed out bit of the surface is neither insignificant nor significant, neither less important nor more important, neither inadequate nor adequate, neither wrong nor right, neither unwanted nor wanted’ and it could perhaps indeed provide a surface for new metaphors or narratives to adhere to. This was to be critically important in the instance of photography if ‘other’ records of memory were to be added so that the works acquired a living context and as John Berger says, ‘Photographs are relics of the past, traces of what has happened’. This idea combined with the placing of these photographic elements would re-acquire a living context, they would continue to exist in time, instead of being arrested moments.

---

61 Fairchild, A, Outside the Frame, Main Objectives, Q3, p.1, 2010
63 Berger, J, About Looking, p.61, 1991, USA
Taking as a simplified example of one field of vision, things, which occur within the confines of this space, are particular to that moment. The field is at once a ‘space awaiting events’ and at the same time ‘an event in itself’. Similarly the prints with areas erased are also awaiting events, which maybe from within the same time frame or from past or future times. They may be from similar or contradictory locations.

For example if we look at three sketched examples taken from the analysis journal (Fig. 33a), erasing through light tones, we can further discuss this working method and its qualities. In the sketch of whitened out Wish Tree Hill we can observe that the plan for something is given particular focus and that the two focused points of a journey back and forth are also highlighted. The bleached out/erased areas within the space - time frame of the set, even further emphasize the tilted perspective within the image.

Fig. 33a Page taken from Reflective Journal

---

64 Berger, J, About Looking, p.204, USA, 1991
In the second of these two sketches the apparent coincidentally lost items, which appear almost identical are emphasized as is their relationship to and echoing of the double line of horizon in the distance. In a more heightened sense the erasure of the vast majority of the printed image at once isolates and connects these objects with the boundary lines in the distance. Our eyes move from one to the other and the ‘mists of erasure’ forever change the rhythm of the print. Torn between two echoes of the same, one man-made, the other the forever-intangible horizon, these highlighted areas reflect what Berger describes in the migrant nature of city inhabitants as the demonstration of what they had to forget and what they had to learn’.  

In the third of these three sketches where the tree is inverted at the base of the image offering a reflection on the continuum of the journey back and forth, here to there, other concepts are apparent. The idea of what we recall, of ‘there’ when we are ‘here’, and what we, undoubtedly, recall of ‘here’ when ‘there’ is reinforced through isolation of these two elements. These two spaces could be separated in space and time also and could be reflections of varying belief systems or cultures. The overlaid drawn elements here reflect the collaged ideals, which as Jodi Hauptman describes in her observation of this tool in Lutz Becker’s recently curated ‘Modern Times’ review of drawing as a ‘most intimate tool...’ This method of research enabled me to use, as Hauptman describes, ‘...the erasing, and smudging, tearing and pasting...’ as a way ‘...in which artists negotiate opposing terms ideals and beliefs.’

Sequencing and notions of time and place

(Nietzsche)

From this point onwards the practice centred on a large series of works where the screen printed images were erased, fragmented, collaged and combined to explore many possibilities of form and narrative structures, which inevitably lay beneath the immediate content of the three drawings. This section will analyse and evaluate to what extent this series of works could offer a new way of constructing visual narrative exploring notions of time and space with regard to individual or sequences of images.


Here, analysis of the images suggests that less of the drawn image could create a more concentrated level of meaning and content. This could then be infused with even more of a presence through whole or fragmented parts of the screen prints. Much of this new direction was driven by the intentional as well as accidental input of the inherent qualities of the screen-printing process. Areas had become accidentally lost or mis-registered giving way to new visual references and links between areas of the drawn images as well as links between time and place, which previously had been less specifically identified.

For example, two selected print collage combinations reveal these qualities quite clearly. (Fig.34, 35)

'I saw the notebook as a symbol of personal record, erasing of that means erasing of memory, fading of memories in time.'\textsuperscript{67}

The deconstructed image of Wish Tree Hill (Fig.34) using screen-prints and collage reveals new layers of time through the intentionally absent areas of some of the print. Selection here has been made to omit the central section of the screen print by obscuring the silk mesh to allow only the far horizon line and the immediate foreground to be printed. Repeated prints on low quality paper have also been used creating the effect of another layer of time being revealed, some temporarily pasted or fly posted image, peeling back to reveal layers of time.

\textbf{The original story has been undone by successive layers of disruption allowing subversion of the original narrative and newly presented connections to be made and another non-linear structure to be reconstructed through the absence of what was.}

\textsuperscript{67} Unal, U, Outside the Frame Responses, 2011
Fig. 34 Wish Tree Hill collage
Fig. 35 Here to There collage
Drawing taken from another location has then been superimposed onto this with a wide variety of more abstract marks, which appear blurred. Some sort of transition between the two spaces or layers of time is at play here.

'It is as if the new adding is coming to life. It is stressing the importance of the colored bit and that being a part of a tree I think it is coming back to life. But it can also mean that the artist or someone interfering the drawing is trying to cover something that they don’t want us to see with a patch. It can be a bad memory.'

Repeated, isolated drawn fragments of street maps from a location other than the main image hover at the centre of the erased area of the image. The concept here is to establish a more present reference where we appear to be confronted with the same parts of a small area of street plan dislocated from any area surrounding it.

This type of deconstruction of combinations was providing substantial direction for the research with or without the addition of photographic elements. Practice at this point was focussing on the extent to which these collaged works could, through their deconstruction, describe at least the elements of memory of one place and as Galpin asserts ‘erasure is inextricably formed by the thing that it erases.’ Combined with ideas about the dislocation and fragmentation of an urban condition within another space how far could these images be stretched in their own right to discuss and explore some idea of the present being a future memory and philosophical arguments for present actions being sufficient for past events? Some precedence had been set in my previous work for this when utilising layering and its uses through printmaking with a series of work from 2009, of which Keeping Warm 1 and 2 (Fig.36, 37) are good examples. Here the layers of time and print are combined in such a way that each method has its own time frame. Erasures of one surface through monoprint make way for another time frame to occur through another form of print. For example, the digital aspect of the prints is restricted to only one element of the layering, referencing the present time. The historical content of the prints is described through the existing unique book pages with its reference to nostalgic elements already present in the body of the found page used.

---

68 Unal, U, Outside the Frame Responses, 2011

69 Richard Galpin, Erasure in Art: Destruction, Deconstruction and Palimpsest, p.3, 1998
The collagraphic element of the prints was used to refer to the notion or idea present human condition within each of the images.

Similarly through experimentation into erasure and layering of processes of the three large screen-prints a process of extracting less from each image to describe more about that particular time frame was established. In effect creating a fragmented loose-leaf narrative extracted from a larger one, having layers of meaning embedded within it. As described above, both intentional and accidental loss of areas of the prints revealed the poignant elements, or in some cases the more banal areas infusing the image with developing layers of narrative through use of collage or tracing. This allowed new meaning to become revealed from outside the immediate frame of reference with entry from other time frames emerging within the images. The process of importing actual maps from the time and the place location of ‘now’ began to add a present (future memory) dimension to the emerging sequence of images. This use of collage or hand drawn remnants and tracings of contemporary maps was applied more intuitively here.

This was intentionally to research the effect the contrast an application would appear to have on the images. The contemporary work of Ingrid Calame an artist who traces actual elements of locations, layering them one on top of another, reflecting the here and now of any given site offered a precedent for the use of this kind of work. Calame’s ‘Image no. 297’, 2008 an example of developing layers of traced imagery from of actual locations where the unexpected arises not only through the varying nature of the sites themselves, but through the process of making. In a similar way I was setting out to achieve some incidental elements to the work so that the images did indeed become more particular and specific to the time and space they were constructed in as well as being about a place. This particular and specific abstraction of real spaces can be highly representational of place and time. (Fig.38)

‘The foggy look and yellow warning “light” gives this drawing a more apocalyptic look. So for me the map parts here don’t imply to reconstruction but again being lost and deterioration.’

________________________

70 Unal, U, Outside the Frame Responses, 2011
Indeed fragmentation through abstraction it seems can be representational of a space and place in time. As Ingrid Calame puts this, 'My journey through tracing different sites, working with and meeting people and seeing their reactions to the work - all this has changed my understanding of representation and abstraction.'\(^{71}\) Where my practice departed from this was that I intended to use this tracing to articulate particular ideas when combined with and in contrast to other areas of my creative practice.

Another contemporary artist whose work influenced the direction of the research at this stage was Jenny Wiener. For Wiener, drawing of one function is layered upon drawing of another obscuring elements of each layer as the work progresses to retrace the memory of a place. In essence, the drawing becomes more complex in its layers, and yet less complex visually. Wiener’s work analyses and reveals the way in which numerical systems we create underpin our lives. In terms of numerical systems we can see in the detail of one of the altered prints of the ‘Lost Things’ (Fig.39) series that numbers and references are used from the other two images to convey ideas similar to those in geology where objects, fossils or remnants may be removed from the time frame in which they existed by larger geological movements. They could also be references to identification tags used in an investigation or enquiry, perhaps. Here numerical coding is used to refer to other places or times.

‘The yellow number 2 on left top corner implies that this the second drawing in a series. The blue numbers indicate that the items are actually found and registered like evidence after a police inquiry.’\(^{72}\)

The deconstructions of prints and combinations with other drawn elements became not so much linear, which the initial three graphite drawings had suggested, as radial in their associations of memory. That is more akin to the observations of Berger when he discusses the idea that, ‘memory works radially, that is to say with an enormous number of associations all leading to the same event.’\(^{73}\) This also began to suggest other possibilities for how the works might be grouped together or displayed. Could the works be grouped in type? Or indeed could some of the larger images have additional smaller ‘addendum’ type posters or

\(^{71}\) Berning, D, The Guardian, Saturday 19 September 2009

\(^{72}\) Unal, U, Outside the Frame Responses, 2011

\(^{73}\) Berger, J, About Looking, 1991, USA, p.65
flyers, which supplemented the larger works. Perhaps these could be displayed in a radial format more to suggest the incidental fragmentation of fly posted urban walls. Prior to this the text within many of the works was researched, deconstructed and experimented with before and after the combination with photographic elements.

Analysis of text

Through the process of print it was important to respond to those elements and areas of text within the drawings, which had been lost though incidental uneven pressure placed onto the mesh of the silkscreen. The character of the prints then changed quite dramatically. Reflecting on this, the practice began to progress in such a way that other areas could be made to have seemingly never existed if paper was placed as an obstacle to the printing process. Through this method smaller or larger sections of work could be omitted to make reading of the images more obscure. This was particularly used and explores to hide text so that other areas of the work could be allowed to come into focus, or to leave a space for other print or collaged elements from elsewhere to be inserted into the images. Hence dramatic or subtle changes in meaning could be established. As Galpin says ‘Additive subtraction is a contradiction that suggests a play of differences, rather than an absence of a presence’.74

Either through repeating overlays of text or twisting and combining text so that large areas of it are unreadable, text could become material. It could evolve into marks, more calligraphic in their nature or could cover vast areas, which could become a new surface for other image or information to adhere to. Work by the painter Cy Twombly here was an important precedent for this use of, as Nick Wadley describes, ‘...words among the lines, and lines that behave like a script across the paper. Title and signature can also play a significant role in the forms and composition of a drawing.’75

To explore this idea of text becoming material a series of small sketches where the respondent marks drawn/written through text across the images became the surface material itself, paving the way for new material to form upon it. The illustrations within this section of the project to explore to what extent varying forms of text could achieve different results and could then further be utilised. Some of the experimentation with stencilling and spray text would later be used within some of the more abstract poster designs, which would form much of the palimpsest poster material. Throughout the process of using the marks of text to

---

74 Galpin, R, Erasure in Art, 1998
obscure the surface of the images a more intuitive series of works emerged so far that that which remained was reminiscent of the concept described by Robert Rauschenberg when he produced the erased De Kooning using 40 erasers in one month! ‘To purge myself of teaching’ and indeed to find out ‘whether a drawing could be made out of erasing’. Galpin goes on to discuss the concept of drawing over, layering and one surface of elements or marks erasing another only to become a new surface themselves, ‘inevitably polluted by the traces of the background’. It was this ‘pollution’ or embodiment of the city used as a surface that I was trying to achieve.

A series of sketch works were then made and analysed within the journal using handwriting marks using as precedent the paintings and drawings of Rauschenberg, De Kooning and Cy Twombly. Twombly’s work particularly uses these aspects and his drawn and painted work on paper is of particular note in relation to this project. His work ‘The Geeks’ from 1955 and ‘Bolsena’ 1969 (Fig.40,41). These are two examples where the marks made directly from both conscious and unconscious thought are directly translated through the handwritten marks providing us with a personal more anthropological interpretation of a visual or physical experience, which, as the sculptor Richard Serra puts it, offers a view of ‘the most credible indication of who people are.’

The difference with my use of these kind of graphological tools was that I intended them to be used combined and yet in contrast with other working methods to describe contrasts in experience or time within the same image.

However, these pieces would start to become more about painting surface and texture than I had anticipated or wanted to combine with the other element of photography. Although technically not going to be as useful in this combination they could describe a move towards perhaps a more textural three-dimensional response, which could be another approach for future practice.

“These overlays where text has become material seem to be working in yet another direction in my practice, which is possibly more painterly, about surface and texture and a history embedded within that. More about an emotional narrative response, but one where images have little place to operate.’

---

77 Galpin, R, Erasure in Art: Destruction, Deconstruction and Palimpsest, p.4 Feb 1998 USA
78 Wadley, N, Modern Times: responding to chaos, p.11 2010, England
79 Fairchild, A, Reflective Journal, Outside The Frame, 2011
Fig. 40 *The Geeks* Cy Twombly, 1955

Fig. 41 *Bolsena*, Cy Twombly, 1969
Fragments of these samples and the way they were constructed were used though and this reflected Nick Wadley’s thoughts on drawing as an object when discussing the work of Jasper Johns from the 1960s and 70s, “Johns uses an area of graphite hatching in his work in the same way as a stencilled word or a painted image or a nailed-on tin can.” Quoting Johns who says, ‘Take an object, do something to it, do something else to it.’ He goes on to say, “Drawing is one of those objects.”

Drawing is one object. Collage is another object and what to this can we add as a series of other ‘objects’?

‘Through overlays of text and mark making through graphology, the images become invested with a temporary layer...The coloured lettering, which is stencilled with spray paint takes on a slightly more formal dimension because it can similarly be repeated through the act of stencilling – implying some outside authoritative intervention. This was intended to reference road markings or plans by urban authorities such as highways to correct faults or make alterations or additions to public areas within towns and cities.’

(Fig.42)

---

81 Fairchild, A, Outside the Frame, reflective Journal, 2011
Photography

To restate as Berger says, ‘Photographs are relics of the past, traces of what has happened’ \(^{82}\) place and often contain within them, series of other events or objects. It has the power to offer a unique view of a place or an experience which may be personal but which also can be more widely recognisable exactly because it is such a trace of the real.

This section analyses and evaluates the content and meaning inherent within a selection of photographs taken from London, Luton and Istanbul. It looks at how photos ‘...are perhaps the most mysterious of all the objects that make up and thicken the environment we recognise as modern’. \(^{83}\) In fact it is by photographic images that we are daily served as fleeting glimpses of the urban spaces we inhabit forever in a process of change. From news and magazine images to billboards, hoardings and packaging, photography supplies us with visual records of events in time and conveys our needs, our desires and our wants in any given season, ‘anesthetized and fastened down like butterflies’. \(^{84}\)

It looks at the similarities between the three urban centres as well as those things, which make up their unique character and how careful selection of the locations of each photo was made to convey each city’s individual characteristics. Furthermore, the analysis in the latter part of this section will examine to what extent the combination of these photos with the other methods of working; drawing and print, have answered the research question.

Analysis of photographs from three urban centres

This analysis is of photographs taken from the streets of Luton, Bedfordshire and surrounding urban areas. Fig.43, carefully selected from the shattered window of a public language and educational centre, the image has links to the wide variety of language and learning assistance available within the urban environment. Publicly funded centres like this exist on a minimal budget and are, now, even under serious threat of closure due to the current economic climate of the first decade of the 21st century. The smashed widow with its traces of human blood seem to reflect a possible anxiety and frustration within a modern, urban.

\(^{82}\) Berger, J, About Looking, 1991, USA  
\(^{83}\) Berger, J, About Looking, p.53 from Susan Sontag on photography, 1991, USA  
\(^{84}\) Barthes, R, Camera Lucida: Reflections on Photography, 1980
European cultural community having a complex variety of 21st century dilemmas. The Dyspraxia Foundation poster to the top right hand corner emphasises this physical aspect of urban alienation.

This photograph was integrated into the original poster image for *Wish Tree Hill* contrasting this impression of British urban life with the drawn memory of a location off the coast of the urban metropolis of Istanbul, Turkey.

The next four photographs were selected to represent something of the textures and shapes of a 21st century urban environment, showing materials such as sheet metals, cast concrete and the interior space within urban parking spaces and commercial areas. Again these photos have been used in combination with other more historical and natural environments in the *'Lost Things'* and *'Here to There'* poster images. Fig.45 is pavement texture, containing marks of use, the history of passing pedestrians embedded within its surface, like any pavement in any contemporary urban space. The textures and surfaces in these photos are reminiscent of Berger when he reflects that 'Only somebody who has lived in the streets of a city, suffering some kind of misery, can be aware of what the paving stones, the doorways, the bricks, the windows signify. At street level – outside a vehicle – all modern cities are violent and tragic.'85 The intention here is to fix 'the now' within the context of future and past memories. Fig.46 seems particularly to reflect Berger's observation that, "Photographs are relics of the past, traces of what has happened."86 Fig.48 is the reflection of an empty urban staircase mirror to the sometime monotony and often experienced anonymity within contemporary urban existence. Elements of this photo have been used in combination with drawn and printed work in an attempt to place the viewer within the frame of the collaged image.

---

85 Berger, J, About Looking, Ralph Fasanella and the City, p. 105 1991, USA
86 Berger, J, About Looking, p. 61, 1991, USA
The spaces within cities are constricted and uneven, often offering little glimpse of the horizon. That is to say no view towards the intangibility of time and space. Where can we look for a comparative space similar to that which man saw when he stood upright for the first time? We may look upwards. Figs.49 and 50 were taken with this in mind, reflecting the view that the space of sky we may now observe is rather like Berger’s ‘field’ of events waiting to occur; a plane moves in the distance across the field of sky, captured at one fraction of its journey. In photo no. 8 a plane passes and a construction crane looms erect against the dusk sky. We cannot see the city here, yet it is evident in that fact that such a crane would only likely appear within an urban environment where construction and deconstruction occur. The crane has been used in a variety of the poster images in combination with the ‘Lost Things’ drawings. Drawings where layers of time and landscape have been identified and where ordering and number identification has been incorporated into the image as have the series of observed drawings of skulls. The crane with passing plane is a contemporary metaphor for the human need to unearth the past and to hurry the present forward, as Blaise Pascale says, “We are so unwise that we wander about in times that are not ours and blindly flee the one that is. The fact is that the present usually hurts.”

Urban environments across cultures clearly have both aspects in common as well as differing characteristics making them each unique parts of a global family. Many of the photos used in the combination works were taken in the sprawling urban metropolis of Istanbul, Turkey. Istanbul sits on the cusp of both European and Asian cultures, a bridge to the east as well as a link to the west. Many of the photographs (Figs. 50-53) reflect things about the nature of 21st century urban environments as well as having acute characteristics particular to Istanbul itself. In Fig.50a, taken from the European west shore of Istanbul looking out over the stretch of water to the east shore situated in Asia, an idea of the transition between these two places as well as a culmination in the unifying aspect of the city together with what makes it unique is reflected. This idea of the links that connect us, and the chains, which bind us within urban environments, is also expressed through the reflection of chains in the window the photograph was shot through.

---

Figs. 53 and 54 are examples of fly posting and graffiti in Istanbul, Turkey, having similarities and differences to those within British urban environments. On the one hand the techniques involved such as speed of application within the urban environment, use of quick and simple spray stencilling techniques are universal due to the slightly subversive nature of the activity in question. The torn appearance of the paper elements, which at first would seem to be very temporary because they are simply paper, appear to have more longevity upon the surfaces to which they are applied. The differences between specifically these and other similar graffiti works within UK cities is the context of alphabet and language structure. That is to say how calligraphic type ‘tags’ (signatures of the graffiti artists) may vary due to cultural and language differences across cultures.

Fig. 54 shows a section of wall collage and a service cable box in Istanbul, which has been caught within the framework of both an area of graffiti and fly posting. There are clearly examples here of European fonts and language as well as Arabic script. So here is a useful example of a fusion of many of the variants found within street art from London, Luton and Istanbul.

So, if these photographs can be said to be imbued with the city as a living, breathing place, then their combination with other ways of working; drawing, print and photography, it follows, would place this contemporary trace of a community’s place and time within the context of references to more personal memories and constructed metaphorical narratives. Graeme Sullivan discusses this with reference to Jayne Dyer’s ‘Site’, 1998.

Derrida the trace—truth in painting

‘A basic principle that defines what it is to be human is the need to be located within contexts that confirm our identity...this place and identity may occupy a space that is caught between the physical and temporal...Making meaning becomes a negotiation between what is known and felt as the concrete becomes the critical. Any site, therefore, is shaped by insight’.

The following section analyses a range of the work undertaken, which explores just these ideas. It will look at how the carefully selected photographs have been combined with the range of collage, print and drawing work. It will explore how the contrasts in these image-making processes and working methods have been combined to explore and articulate a series of varying narratives between the three urban centres.
According to Berger, “If we want to put a photograph back into the context or experience, social experience, social memory, we have to respect the laws of memory...situate the printed photograph so that it acquires something of that which was and is.”

Combining some of the selected photographs with prints and collage from the three initial drawings enabled some of the resulting images to acquire that was and is. Two examples of this follow. The first is the poster for ‘Wish tree Hill’ (Fig.55) where torn elements of repeated prints are overlaid and peeled back to reveal areas of the original laid over the drawing. This has been combined with actual fly posting from the city of Istanbul giving a real is and now to the image, situating it in the actual space of a city yet slightly removed in that it is the photograph of the posting, a trace of what has been. The second is a poster from the series for ‘Lost Things’ where overlays of repeat prints have been combined with drawn traced elements of Luton street maps. (Fig.56) The piece has become quite disjointed through the misalignment of prints and the rotation of drawn elements and collage. The introduction of the photograph here has taken a more contemporary image and placed it back in an area of ruins out of context and out of time. This locates the present recall of memory within the context of past time and another city.

Analysis and drawing, print and photography combinations

Much of the collage and combination work at this point became centred on producing smaller additional pieces, which could supplement the larger work. This was also the first point at which some aspect of the presentation of the work was to influence the actual making and research of the work itself. Without deciding on any final display for any of the poster works made so far it became clear that part of the concept within the individual pieces also lay in the selection and grouping of the work and the way in which they might be displayed or exhibited in any given space. Alternatives which were site specific could be important when considering size or scale of any of the works in relation to others.

88 Berger, J, About Looking, 1991, USA
Lost objects revealed again after time has lost objects again
‘Lost Again’ presents
‘Lost Things’
Some exploration of the way the images were viewed or grouped together begin also to answer one of the initial questions about how this could ‘reflect and explore ideas of the impact of accelerated change or act as an antidote to the ‘violence’ of the advanced, urban, industrial environment and an antithesis to the idea that ‘social change is replaced by a change in images’ 89? In other words the contextual research suggested that there was indeed a precedent for the kind of image being produced within contemporary practice and that indeed it was part of a move towards work, which was more ‘engaged’ with modern urban global dilemmas. The research here suggested that these images could refer to something of the identity of those seen in many urban areas such as posters or flyers, but which could also offer an antidote to that particular pace of imagery by combining it with more abstract and contemplative work. Much of the poster was designed so that it appeared to advertise events about desire or longing or the attainment of something, but which was also combined with simple reflections of urban surroundings and combined with string visual imagery exploring more personal memories and experiences drawn from my time spent moving between the urban spaces over the last decade. This was explored to articulate a new way of expressing a visual antithesis or ‘antidote’ to the modern urban spaces we inhabit.

In order to create poster works, which were reflective of the urban centres the addition of photographic elements as traces was important. The next area to test was the extent to which the already deconstructed images using drawing and print processes could be combined with photography to create new narrative structures exploring ideas and concepts within present time and place and its relationship to past or future events within the context of culturally contrasting urban environments.

Here there was a return to the present location of Luton and area where objects and observations discovered whilst visiting local sites. Images such as the rabbit skull images

89 Fairchild, A, Outside the Frame, Main Objectives, Q3, p.1, 2010
became quite forceful in determining the direction of some of the drawings. Locally sourced maps and much of the reading on Situationist ideas and concepts including an interest in the unplanned spaces within an urban centre as well as a fascination with advertisements and magazines. It began to direct the research, questioning to what extent these situational images of mammal skulls, referring to ideas of mortality, could be fused with other more contemporary urban images or tracings from street plans and the concept of development versus decay. The concept of the rabbit as a pest from one point of view, and as a highly developed member of an animal community became a complex metaphorical image within the work. These images can be read as metaphors for contemporary communities or indeed groups, which may have a particular ideology. Linking this with other ideas from the newly emerging drawings and combinations could in effect become designs for a space or event outside the frame of the visual image. The drawings or posters seemed to suggest themselves as plans for a ‘new urban environment’ in a Situationist manner, a visual manifesto for change.

Using combinations of process as ways to re-explore the visual aspects of the work ultimately included some reduction and/or deconstruction of the text within the images. Remnants of some elements of text as well as visible words can imbue the images with specific meaning and ideas or concepts. In fact how much or little text is necessary to convey some meaning of events and yet lead towards a more intuitive response to the images overall was one key intention of this deconstructive process. Indeed, can diverse fragments of text and language, even those transposed from one culture into another, form a new sphere of ‘advertising’ images ‘offering alternative narrative time sequencing for currently advertised events?’

The following analysis looks at a range of work, which explores these ideas through the construction of a range of posters designed around each theme of the three original drawings.

A selected image for the poster series ‘Here to There’ (Fig.57) reveals layers of urban texture adding contemporary dimensions to a kind of primitive, totemic monochrome skull drawing. A

90 Sadler, S, The Situationist City, 1999, US
91 Fairchild, A, Outside the Frame, Methodology, Q3, p.2, 2010
sense of much time having passed and the resultant decay, which is evident from the skull and general fragmentation of the image, is evident within this example.

Fig. 4 reveals some of what we can see is a naturally occurring palimpsest within photographs taken from urban centres. Time passing and identity are revealed through erasure of paint surfaces on old door. Decay through the passing of time enabling us to see layers of previous urban history is then overlaid with more contemporary examples of graffiti, which sits over surfaces from without the time the graffiti was applied. Added to this is text and drawings from the narrative within the three posters. The word ‘Plan’ is repeatedly spray painted over the corner image suggestive of earmarking for urban development and yet another sense of impending erasure.

Fig. 59 explores some of what Robert Morgan describes when talking about obscured text that, ‘the covering of language carries with it the suggestion that what is present beneath is significant in view of its absence’\(^{92}\). Graffiti has been obscured through overlaid text, which then is obscured by repeats of the same text. In order to attain significance it is repeated. This repetition obscures the clarity, but redefines the importance of the text through its absence. There is something here of the re-painted hastily altered wall surfaces of inner urban locations.

Within the two previous images is a key concept within the idea of non-linear narrative and critical to the concept of how future and past events can be linked within the present. Viewed within the frame of one image, this insight would be used as research within groups of poster images to see how combinations of this type of narrative structure could describe contrasting urban environments.

During the following section of the project a wide range of posters were designed exploring many combinations of collected/found and constructed/drawn imagery. Many of the resulting posters were complex combinations of London, Luton and Istanbul. In order to extract and analyse some poignant elements from these works, long thin slices through sections of the posters were cut and placed on a white background. These were separately analysed in my reflective journal some examples of which follow.

‘With more expanses of blank image in this slice, implied here is the space for development – looks towards both the past (through nostalgia of repeated ship images) – the future – blank page or text awaiting future additions or more subtractions prior to those additions’ (Fig. 60)

‘Radically altered reading of visual information when compared to the original poster format image. Objects now appear to be drifting, falling downwards passing in front of an image which has even more focus from another space (photo of decaying urban wall)...remnants of place, direction and partially decayed objects referring to human presence or removal...a derelict chapter within fast changing urban narrative’ (Fig. 59)

The development of the poster work exploring aspects of the combinations of the three cities was to then to paste these posters together in three groups centred on each of the original three poster drawings. This referenced much of the photographic fly posting images that had been collected during the project. (Fig.62)
Fig. 59 Poster test
Fig. 60 Journal extract

Lithic, more exposed to bleach image in this place. Implied here to spaced. for development. tiles toward back in front. (through restoration of repeated time image) and the figure - black page or first attending some relations or wrong informations prior to these additions. Most reference in this fragment to a palimpsest image.

Fig. 61 Journal extract

Though the judged, fragmented image changes are radically altered in reading of visual information then compared to the original painted image. Objects now appear to be drifting flowing through the image in front of an image which has been more than just another space (no at damaging defined urban wall).

Strength drawn in from left of image through these are then become left suspended through fragments of a series of life, immensity of place, direction and partially damaged objects referring to human presence or removal. The core elements of the form of a remnant, a derived chapter within fast changing urban narrative.
Fig. 62 Istanbul fly posting
A wall of images was then constructed for each poster ‘Wish Tree Hill’, ‘Lost Things’ and ‘Here to There’. (Fig.7, 8, 9) This was to be critical to outcomes of the project relating to the idea of constructed or authored narratives and the importance placed of the reading by the viewer based in time and experience referred to previously in Berger’s ‘Between Two Colmars’.

How could these combinations of found and constructed narratives acquire new structure from the complex combinations as well as the input of the viewer and the time the objects were viewed in?

The locating of a selection of fifteen of the combined poster works at my exposition at The Hat Factory, Luton in October 2011 was a useful method of testing how these images combined within a particular time and location.

Here Derridian ‘Difference’ is referenced where the already deconstructed images within a palimpsest of posters are allowed, each one, to subvert the image of the others placed on top of it or without an agreeable space between so that new stories and connections are created. This being infinitely variable for each locating of the collection of the work.

Viewers of the work in the space would inevitably bring their own readings to the work, which would of course reflect their own personal experiences of any visual imagery they encountered as well as the context of events of the time. Here Derrida’s ‘Difference’ argues that the perceiver’s view is always in a state of flux and any reading will vary from one place and time to another. This idea within already multiple layers of stories within the images through deconstruction of the poster images reflects our ever-changing interaction with the contemporary spaces we inhabit.

Some example responses to this display within the exposition follow (Fig.66, 67, 68)

‘A powerful expression of what it is to be in an alien environment’

‘We can see the ends of all the threads of where you have come from’

‘It’s as if we are seeing the internal workings of the mind and body within a space’

This was to form part of the outcome for the project, and at the same time provide another question to be explored in a tangential project called ‘Glasshouse Stories’ based at the Walled Garden of Luton Hoo House in Bedfordshire.
This work was based on containment of urban sprawl through the development of Luton around the mid 19th century and the idea that the historic walled garden could be a sanctuary or vessel for the memory or containment of precious plants and stories (Fig.69, 70).

Location of the work and critically others’ responses to and reading of the work would also form much of the basis for another outcome for the research project similar to my work from ‘Locus’ at The Bath Festival in 2009. And the series ‘Where are we now?’
Fig. 66 Outside the Frame Exposition, The hat Factory, 2011,
Outside the Frame Exposition, The hat Factory, 2011
Fig. 69 *Glasshouse Stories*, Luton Hoo Walled Garden project, 2011

Fig. 70 *Glasshouse Stories*, Luton Hoo Walled Garden project, 2011
This idea of wide ranging spaces within urban spaces; the hidden corners within the places we inhabit everyday could provide the location to install concepts and ideas which would, by their nature, change the readings of those objects installed; the same object within a new space, the same object within the same space in different light in a different time.

These objects may be witnessed by a variety of viewers; some travelled; some native.

"Combined the lore of faraway places, such as a much-travelled man brings home, with the lore of the past, as it best reveals itself to natives of a place." 93

And indeed the pieces viewed are a complex mix of personal memory, witnessed visual traces in the form of photography as well as constructed fictional narrative used to describe a

---

93 Benjamin, W, The Storyteller, 1936
wider experience of a community. Thus reflecting a ‘kind of fractured identity or a response to the overlapping of reality and fiction that increasingly characterises our experiences’.

Most, if not all contemporary urban environments are theatres for continuous change within construction or events from buildings to theatre, art and music. Many of these are wide ranging and reflect the culturally diverse spectrum of people and cultures that inhabit or visit these urban spaces. Through photographic research of some of these real space visual palimpsests (Fig.73, 74) a further direction for research and possibly a resolution for display of the project emerged. Reflection of the narrative of contemporary events within cities, two references, one contemporary, and one historical seemed applicable. Structure and composition within medieval painting, for example works by Lorenzetti (Fig.75) provided a direction and mechanism for the construction of a palimpsest ‘wall’ of works with its flattened perspective. How these kinds of paintings were ‘collaged’ together to reflect the complex nature of activity and belief within medieval cities.

From a more contemporary aspect the work of the artist Raymond Hains offered precedence for this type of work as a starting point. Hains and the ‘New Realist’ movement created products somewhere between Pop Art and ironic capitalist enterprise. His works created using torn found poster remnants were constructed in a similar way to some of the research and yet the images collaged during my project were rather more specific in their concerns in that they would attempt to construct an alternative narrative, which expressed variations in sequences of events.
In fact the torn poster elements were part of my working methods to articulate a particular aspect to then be combined with other methods within some of the images.

Being that the starting point for the practice-led research had been a series of posters for unseen events, it seemed appropriate to utilise some of these works also to form a diverse series of posters and flyers, which could then perhaps saturate a given amount of surface or
wall space providing an actual backdrop for the viewer to interact with. Many of the photographs I had taken of Istanbul consisted of naturally occurring palimpsests, walls that revealed their history through multitudes of surfaces and interactions with the life and lives within the city. Posters reflecting the diverse range of events both musical and visual placed one next to or on top of another so that serendipitous connections could be made across the groups of images and between contrasting elements of them. These posters were formed by taking aspects of the original drawn and hand manipulated collages, tracings and layers of printing techniques and then digitally combining these with photographic images so that any number of mechanical reproductions could be made, repeating the same poster and presenting these with other layers of similarly formed posters. This concept on reproducing these posters in multiples reflects Walter Benjamin when he says that, ‘In making many copies of the reproduction, it substitutes for its unique incidence a multiplicity of incidences.’

A series of these ‘posters’ would need to be produced some more or less abstract in their image or content to provide this ‘tapestry’. As Richard Galpin refers to Lawrence Alloway in his palimpsest essay on deconstruction describing this re-emergence in John Latham’s relief works of 1960 as a non-verbal art appearing ‘out of the wreckage of the printed word’. The effacement of the known code is related to the emergence of a previously unknown object.

Then this ‘previously unknown object’ could combine with photographic records of the urban centres in question ‘act as a platform for expressing both a personal or community experience of displacement combined with a more historical visual record of memory or experience.’

---

96 Alloway, L, John Latham, University of California Press, 1960
97 Outside the Frame, Main Objectives, Q3, p.1, 2010
Conclusion

A visual record of memory or experience, which can create, through narrative structures an expression of chosen contrasting urban environments has been at the heart of this practice-led exploration and research.

Naturally occurring, contemporary urban palimpsests of images are ones where narratives arrive at themselves and, in doing so, are true reflections of the cities we inhabit. Through my practice based on an accumulation and erosion of different types of imagery, which reflect observations and experiences of different urban centres the emerging palimpsests have revealed themselves. Through erasure and addition and the natural decay and change evident within urban spaces as together with the interaction of inhabitants as ‘readers’ impressions on those images or objects these images can articulate the contrasting urban sites selected. It is evident from insights gained and responses to the work that, in fact this newly established way of working could articulate the experiences between other urban centres whether they are more contrasting or more similar to one another.

Having no obvious beginning or end, images can forever be embedded in the past through the present. This way of working gives rise to non-linear narratives through layering, both serendipitous and constructed through human input. These can be a forever-changing surface of stories. They can articulate the many manifest complexities of our contemporary cities.

Complex, multi-facetted poster images can reflect contrasting, contemporary, urban experience through a combination of creative processes.

The narrative can particularly articulate contrasting contemporary urban environments, which are fractured and forever in a state of flux and superimposition and what has been placed, as Lutz Becker describes; ‘an idea of history and culture as a field or matrix in which many different links can be made across time and space.’

A personal memory or history can be left to reveal itself within the framework of more widely experienced and recognisable visual images. Interesting and valuable readings or interpretations by others of these resulting images can give new insights and be used for

---

further research to uncover wide-ranging hidden narratives within contrasting urban environments. Whilst these responses by other have been useful and insightful, they were not extensive enough to be used as research. The insights gained have suggested that this method of acquiring responses could be used successfully during future projects.

The never-ending, never beginning nature of non-linear narratives can reflect the challenging urban spaces we inhabit and the ‘yearning after a final object’ within a context, which no longer renders possible its attainment’ and produces ‘specifically modern feelings’99 This can reflect a shared contemporary culturally contrasting urban experience.

In contemporary times non-linear visual narratives give valuable insights into contrasting urban environments that they can be forever evolving and changing because, as Benjamin describes, ‘A story is different. It does not expend itself. It preserves and concentrates its strength and is capable of releasing it even after a long time.’100

The following are specific insights gained from my research and working methods

- Because of the way the creative process and working methods were applied, the images and interplay between those images of the contrasting cities can be read, interpreted and understood in a variety of ways by a variety of viewers. This is underpinned by Barthes ‘The Death of the Author and the critical ideas within that writing suggest that each new image and associated stories ‘read’ from it can be re-authored many times over as there are many possible viewers for that image. These readings are creating and recreating not only the identities of the spaces the images refer to, but of our (the viewer’s) understanding of our philosophical sense of being-in-the-world. 101 These readings are creating and understanding the landscape of the urban spaces we inhabit. And as Simon Schama says, “Before it can ever be a repose for the senses, landscape is the work of the mind. It’s scenery is built up as much from strata of memory as from layers of rock”102

This insight and view is also consistent with Berger’s ‘Between two Colmars’ reflected

100 Benjamin, W, The Storyteller, 1936
in the ways and working methods used to create my images offering the possibility for evoking a similar response so that every individual reading of the same image creates a new story within the context of the time and place it is read.

• Images where stories or narratives reveal themselves by appealing to a deferred or other chain of signs and symbols through layers referencing the Derridian idea that alone these symbols can never fully express themselves can have many richer possibilities. These images can appear more in a state of flux and can have options within them for varieties of readings and so can more fluidly articulate modern urban spaces.

• Consistent with Berger’s ‘Between Two Colmars’, the way in which my images were created offers the possibility for evoking a similar response so that every individual reading of the same image creates a new story.

• Each new story created in regard one or more of the selected cities also adds something new to the identity of those spaces with regard to Barthes ‘The Death of the Author’ and the critical ideas within that writing suggest that each new image and associated stories ‘read’ from it can be re-authored many times over as there are many possible viewers for that image. These readings are creating and recreating not only the identities of the spaces the images refer to, but of our (the viewer’s) understanding of our philosophical sense of being-in-the-world. 103 These readings are creating and understanding the landscape of the urban spaces we inhabit. As Simon Schama says, “Before it can ever be a repose for the senses, landscape is the work of the mind. It’s scenery is built up as much from strata of memory as from layers of rock” 104

• Images where stories or narratives reveal themselves through layers can appear more in a state of flux and can have further possibilities within them for varieties of readings and so can more fluidly articulate modern urban spaces.

—

• Layers of posters articulating personal as well as more community experiences of a space can create a real contemporary sense of those spaces being changing spaces for accumulation of visual and experienced memories and experiences.

---

103 Heidegger, M, Being and Time, Harper and Row, 1962
In light of Soren Kierkegaard’s philosophy of existentialism, which claims that it is an individual’s sole responsibility for giving his or her own life meaning the individual readings and interpretations of the work within my project uphold this idea that it is an ongoing and important aspect of our managing the inhabiting of our contemporary spaces and it is a way we can personally understand something about our own identities within the broader context of those spaces.

Setting the work amidst a context of historical and contemporary work within the fields of drawing, print and photography has enabled understanding of what is similar and what is new about the work I have produced for this project. Through this combined with my other working methods I have established a new paradigm within my own creative practice, which through working methods, I have applied to new projects since producing this research project.

I have established that visual narratives created using my working methods and combinations of creative process and using critical analysis to evaluate those combinations meant that new insights were gained and used to articulate both a personal and more widely held response to the three contrasting urban environments.

I have used working methods which although individually reflect something of the contextual artistic precedents referred to, also differ radically from them. These differences and new established working methods have been achieved through the unique combinations of processes together with a personal intuitive response to those ways of working and have formed a body of work which has enabled me to establish new working methods and indeed a new precedent or paradigm within my own practice for describing the experiences of inhabiting 21st century urban spaces. These new working methods can articulate and particularly reflect where that experience is temporary or forever shifting.

Other artists may be able to utilize this paradigm within my practice and utilize the working methods and combinations of processes to articulate and contextualize their own two-dimensional visual ideas.

This new paradigm of combination of working methods and evaluation of these methods has allowed complex combinations of drawing, screen-printing and collage, to extensively show...
that narrative can be, articulated *Outside the Frame* of sequential linear structure.

I have used those intuitive and responsive elements of my artistic practice to develop images expressing complex ideas. These have been tested and evaluated through combinations of working methods and it is this new collaged and combined working method, which through evaluation has led me to gain new insights and create this new model of working within my own practice.

The combination of narratives and visual imagery taken from these spaces has enabled a multitude of experiences between the personal and the more widely experienced, to be expressed.

The working methods I have employed show that drawn or printed memories of a place or event can be combined with photographic traces of a place or event to articulate a particular or personal response to contrasting environments. Moreover, the unique response of a viewer to these visual narratives has extended that response and further placed the work in another framework. Here it is clear there has been something of a shared experience or response as well as unique ones. This reflects what Berger describes as an act, which ‘refuses the process of disappearances and proposes the simultaneity of a multitude of moments.’

Combined artistic practice where control of images through a directed way of using working methods can be fused with allowing serendipitous aspects of the processes used and layered visual narratives to reveal themselves has particularly created a useful new paradigm of working within my practice.

This new paradigm established a basis where layers of non-sequential narrative can be articulated by me and read by others who can establish their own associations between areas of the visual images as well as authoring new narrative through a personal reading within a given context of time, place and experience.

The locating of the work where it became more of a three dimensional object with a surface of images has revealed an important outcome suggesting further investigation into how part found and part constructed objects could either articulate further the contrasting urban

---

105 Berger, J, Berger on Drawing, 2008, Ireland
spaces chosen or could themselves be used as actual tools to create images which are themselves the trace of these objects.

This could further establish new methods of articulating our contemporary spaces and reflect Brecht point that ‘less than ever does the mere reproduction of reality reveal something about reality’. 106

I have established working methods, which can be used to explore the extent to which two-dimensional visually constructed narratives can articulate our experience of inhabiting contrasting urban spaces.

It is, it seems, our continuing need to describe the ways we use the spaces we make. The new working methods, which have been established form the basis of a new paradigm within my creative practice could be used by others within the field to establish associations between urban or, other environments that may be more contrasting or indeed more closely related to one another.

These working methods could also be used to place within context, any future visual exploration of similar or shared experiences or ideas.

We were and always will be, now, in the dark space of the cave painting narratives and sharing stories.

List of References

Books

Alloway, L, John Latham, University of California Press, 1960
Barthes, R, Camera Lucida, 1980
Biggs, L, Hold, Leeds Metropolitan University Gallery Publications, UK, 1999


Fumerton, R and Jeske, D, Introducing Philosophy through Film, England, 2010


Sadler, S, The Situationist City, US, 1999


Sullivan, G, Art Practice as Research, p.135, UK, 2005


**Journals/Catalogues**


Berning, D, The Guardian, Saturday 19 September 2009

Fairchild, A, Outside the Frame journal, 2011


**Essays / Articles**


Benjamin, W, The Storyteller, 1936

Websites

http://english.istanbul.com/zoom/devrim-erbil-narrates-istanbul - accessed 15.07.10


Outside the Frame: Written Responses

Archer, P, Outside the Frame Responses, 2011

Ross, C, Outside the Frame Responses, 2011

Unal, U, Outside the Frame Responses, 2011

Bibliography

Books


Blessing, J, Trotman, N (Edited by), Haunted: Contemporary Photography, Video, Performance, 2010
Charney, D, Power of Making: The Importance of Being Skilled, V&A Publishing and The Crafts Council, 2011
Foster, H, Recoding: Art, Spectacle, Cultural Politics, Seattle: Bay Press, 1986, USA,
Heidegger, M, Being and Time, Harper and Row, 1962

Journals/Catalogues

Barron, K and Douglas, A, (edited by) Alchemy, Twelve contemporary artists exploring the essence of photography, 2006-07
Istanbul Biennale catalogues 2005, 2007
Deutsche Borse Photography Prize Catalogue, 2009
New Society magazine, A Professional Secret, 1987

Essays/Articles

Barrada, Y, Talking Pictures, Frieze, October, 2011
Barthes, R, The Death of the Author, 1933
Hunt, I, Anna Barriball, 2005
Jasper, A, Fact and Fictions, Frieze, October 2011

Websites
